



UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA  
INTERNATIONAL REVIEW

SPRING 2017

# UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA INTERNATIONAL REVIEW

UF INTERNATIONAL REVIEW IS A FOUNDING MEMBER OF:

## THE NETWORK OF GLOBAL AFFAIRS JOURNALS

The Network of Global Affairs Journals is a consortium of student journals of global affairs.

### **Participant Universities Include:**

Rutgers University, *Global Affairs E-Journal*  
University of Florida, *International Review*  
New York University, *Journal of Human Rights*  
New York University, *Journal of Global Affairs*  
University of Michigan, *Michigan Journal of Political Science* Duke University, *Erudito* Columbia  
University, *Undergraduate Journal of Politics and Society* San Francisco State University, *IR Journal*  
Wellesley College, *IR Council Journal*

Staff may be reached at:  
[ufinternationalreview@gmail.com](mailto:ufinternationalreview@gmail.com)



## EDITORIAL BOARD:

### KELSEY LANDAU, Editor-in-Chief

Kelsey Landau is a senior Political Science and History double major seeking a minor in French and Francophone Studies and a certificate in International Relations. She has interned for the United States Peace Corps in Washington, D.C., Congressman Ted Deutch in Boca Raton, FL, and for the Samuel Proctor Oral History Program and the Center for European Studies at the University of Florida. She has served as the Women's Caucus Chair of the University of Florida College Democrats, the senior editor of *Parallax: Perspectives in Politics*, and as a Junior Fellow for the UF Department of Political Science. She spent fall 2015 studying at France's premier social science university, Sciences Po Paris, and has earned a University Scholars grant to spend the 2016-2017 academic year writing her senior thesis on the history of the Peace Corps. This semester, she was a research intern for the Brookings Institution in Washington, D.C., and will begin work as a research and project assistant at Brookings in June 2017.

### FLORA HABERKORN, Associate Editor

Flora Haberkorn is a junior at the University of Florida studying Economics with a minor in the Chinese language and a certificate in International Relations. She has experience on a variety of political campaigns and some experience in the promotion of women's rights. She also has experience interning for the Everglades National Park Service in the Business department and attending the park visitors. She is currently the Vice President of a non-profit based in Miami called RivMan Initiatives and Charities that focuses on economic development in Florida and abroad. She has conducted independent research analyzing the economic development of poor countries. Her interests include international economic progress in developing countries, sustainable development, and history. She hopes to work for two years in the field of economics before pursuing a master's degree in Economics.

### POOJA MAJMUNDAR, Associate Editor

Pooja Majmudar is a fourth-year Political Science student at the University of Florida. Along with co-editing for the *International Review*, she serves as the President for Global Human Rights Brigade and Membership Vice President of Savant Leadership Honorary at the University of Florida. Majmudar plans to attend law school and later on pursue politics, because she believes that there needs to be more Indian-American representation in the current political system. Her favorite subjects within Political Science are international relations and comparative politics, because she enjoys adding other states as players in the global power game.

### IDO OREN, Faculty Advisor

Dr. Ido Oren is an associate professor and chair of the University of Florida Department of Political Science.

## Table of Contents

THE POLITICS OF EU AND NATO FOREIGN POLICY: THE RUSSIA-UKRAINE CRISIS <b>Hailey Becker</b>	<b>pp. 5-24</b>
FAMILY PLANNING 2020: BARRIERS TO SUCCESS IN SOUTH AFRICA <b>Jaclyn Brenner</b>	<b>pp. 25-36</b>
MODES OF CENSORSHIP IN THE WORLD'S FIVE MOST CENSORED COUNTRIES <b>Laura Cardona</b>	<b>pp. 37-45</b>
USING ECONOMIC SANCTIONS TO ENFORCE HUMAN RIGHTS: THE UNITED STATES AND SOUTH AFRICA <b>Carrie Hartnett</b>	<b>pp. 46-56</b>
AN EXAMINATION OF THE INFANT MORTALITY RATE IN HONDURAS <b>Gregory King</b>	<b>pp. 57-68</b>
CHINA: A POOR STATE IN A RICH-STATE DOMINATED WORLD TRADE REGIME <b>William Noble</b>	<b>pp. 69-81</b>
VIETNAM'S SUSTAINABLE FUTURE <b>Tricia Prevost</b>	<b>pp. 82-93</b>
CUBA'S ECONOMIC POLICIES AND DEVELOPMENT <b>Marcos S. Ramos-Valdés</b>	<b>pp. 94-104</b>
NGO INVOLVEMENT IN POVERTY ALLEVIATION IN BANGLADESH <b>Taylor Scheffing</b>	<b>pp. 105-115</b>
THE UTILITY OF AN INCREASED EMPHASIS ON HUMAN SECURITY TO IMPROVE NATIONAL SECURITY <b>Paul Silva</b>	<b>pp. 116-123</b>

## **The Politics of EU and NATO Foreign Policy: The Russia-Ukraine Crisis**

**By Hailey Becker**

### **Introduction/Background of Crisis**

Historian Anna Reid ironically reveals that “*Ukraina* is literally translated as ‘on the edge’ or ‘borderland’...” (2015, pg. 1). This uncanny translation accurately depicts Ukraine’s unstable past and contentious relationship with Russia. The Russia-Ukraine crisis has had years in the making; it is the result of decades of political debate, clashing identities, and oscillation between East and West.<sup>1</sup> While some argue that the history of the conflict goes back to Ukraine’s time as part of the Soviet Union, when it became a transit country for Russia’s gas exportation (Skalamera, 2015); others insist that the crisis stemmed from Western hegemony through NATO’s enlargement and the EU’s expansion towards eastern Europe (Mearsheimer, 2014). Each of those arguments is well-founded and the crisis can be seen as a consequence of both, but more importantly, the remnants of the USSR and Western influence embedded a cognitive dissonance in ‘Ukrainian’ identity that divided the population and fueled the crisis. The crisis began in November 2013 when Ukrainian President Viktor Yanukovich halted a trade agreement with the EU, which had popular support from the Ukrainian citizens in the western part of the country, and adversely vowed to work with Russia (Reid, 2015).<sup>2</sup> This event caused massive protests in Ukraine’s capital, Kiev, which were met with violence, shifts in government, and chaos. The crisis further escalated in February 2014 when Russia annexed Crimea and sent troops to eastern Ukraine (Reid, 2015). Since then, hundreds have died, Ukraine’s government has switched more than three times, ceasefires and truces have fallen through, and no solution proposed by either the EU or NATO has managed to succeed.

---

<sup>1</sup> East, referring to Russia’s influence, and West, alluding more to the European Union’s pull.

<sup>2</sup> A full timeline of the event in the crisis can be found at <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-middle-east-26248275>.

This paper aims to illustrate that the EU and NATO have not found a viable solution to the Russia-Ukraine conflict because of their differing organizational make-up, varying member nations, and contrasting interests that have caused them to approach the precarious situation with conflicting motives and ultimately separate goals; thus, this paper seeks to test this argument by explaining, interpreting, and evaluating the EU's and NATO's previous strategies and policies within the scope of the last three years to suggest more effective ones. By examining the EU and NATO through economic, political, and security lenses,<sup>3</sup> I will address (1) the recent background of the agents and of the issue, (2) motives and stakes of each actor, (3) previous policies employed to address the issue, (4) why those strategies have failed, and (5) feasible solutions for the future. Albeit many scholars, such as Michael Rühle and Margriet Drent, have constructed theories to understand the complexity of the Russia-Ukraine situation and the nature of EU-NATO relations, and have proposed suggested remedies, this specific argument using the framework or case study of the Russia-Ukraine conflict has not been made previously; thus making it my contribution to the literature. Looking at the shortcomings of EU and NATO policies and how the policies are produced, specifically within the Russia-Ukraine case, is imperative because these powerful global actors influence much of foreign policy decisions throughout the world and thus, the politics behind their decision-making should be understood by the public.

Additionally, the conventional wisdom believes international bodies should be accountable and effective in their resolutions; thus, understanding why their previous policies towards the crisis have failed helps us understand how they can be more effective policy decision-makers in the future. Take for example, the recent shooting down of Malaysian airline

---

<sup>3</sup> I will be looking at both agents' economic, political, and security concerns in the Russia-Ukraine conflict to help explain their strategies beyond simple speculation.

flight in July 2014, which shows the relevance of this issue. This civilian flight, that was shot down by pro-separatist rebels in eastern Ukraine, became a huge controversy in the ensuing months. Furthermore, it reflected the urgent need for NATO and the EU to address and appease the Russia-Ukraine conflict as it continues to pose a threat for innocent people throughout (Pifer & Thoburn, 2014). Many scholars have noted this concern, "...the ability of irredentist nationalists backed by great powers to threaten the peace of Europe has once again become apparent. The shooting down of MH17 also suggests that others from outside the immediate zone of conflict can and will become casualties" (Monash University, 2014). The EU and NATO's respective policies – to be examined – since then have been perpetually weak due to their conflicting interests and the politics behind their foreign policy decisions.

### **Brief History of Agents**

The European Union was established post-World War II as the European Coal and Steel Community (ECSC) to ensure mutual economic dependency through the member states in order to avoid the outbreak of another European war. The EU has (arguably)<sup>4</sup> evolved and grown into a supranational organization of 28 members.<sup>5</sup> Its main committees formally responsible for foreign policy matters are the Common Foreign and Security Policy (CFSP)/Common Foreign and Security Defense Policy (CSDP)<sup>6</sup>, the European External Action Service (EEAS), the Political and Security Council (PSC), and the High Representative of the Union for Foreign

---

<sup>4</sup> Many argue at times that the EU should be considered more intergovernmental rather than supranational.

<sup>5</sup> The current 28 members of the EU are Belgium, Germany, France, Italy, Luxembourg, Netherlands, Denmark, Ireland, United Kingdom, Greece, Spain, Portugal, Austria, Finland, Sweden, Czech Republic, Estonia, Cyprus, Latvia, Lithuania, Hungary, Malta, Poland, Slovakia, Slovenia, and Croatia (European Commission, 2015).

<sup>6</sup> CSDP officially became part of the CFSP in 2009 under the Treaty of Lisbon (Genderen & Legrand, 2016).

Affairs and Security Policy,<sup>7</sup> making the aspects of executing global decisions a lengthy one filled with bureaucratic ‘red tape’ (Genderen & Legrand, 2016).

On the other hand, the North Atlantic Treaty Organization was established prior to the ECSC to warrant increased military cooperation between the member states and eventually attain a robust collective defense strategy towards the rising Soviet Union (NATO, 2012). Similar to the EU, NATO has expanded over the course of the last 68 years and now has 28 member nations.<sup>8</sup> NATO’s main bodies accountable for foreign policy decisions are the NATO Foreign Ministers, the International Staff, the International Military Staff, and several ad-hoc committees that are established when a specific issue arises (NATO, 2016).<sup>9</sup> The lack of consistent structures when dealing with foreign affairs makes it increasingly difficult for NATO to execute its policies and plans.

The EU and NATO vary in their purposes for being created – one was created in an attempt at economic ties and peace through diplomacy, while the other was constructed to ensure military protection and stability – yet they are expected to work together, oftentimes when dealing with world crises, like the Russia-Ukraine conflict this paper analyzes. While NATO and the EU have mutual member nations<sup>10</sup>, they do not have all the same member states, making

---

<sup>7</sup> The European Parliament (EP) is informally involved and active in the entire process of the EU’s foreign policy, albeit they don’t have the formal power over foreign affairs that the CFSP/CSDP has (Genderen & Legrand, 2016).

<sup>8</sup> The current members of the NATO are Belgium, Canada, Denmark, France, Iceland, Italy, Luxembourg, Netherlands, Norway, Portugal, the United Kingdom, the United States, Greece, Turkey, Germany, Spain, Czech Republic, Hungary, Poland, Bulgaria, Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania, Romania, Slovakia, Slovenia, Albania, and Croatia (NATO).

<sup>9</sup> The specific actors within NATO that make foreign policy decisions vary based on the situation or issue. For more information on NATO’s structure visit <http://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/structure.htm#OA>.

<sup>10</sup> The 22 overlapping members that EU and NATO share are Belgium, Germany, Denmark, France, Italy, Luxembourg, Netherlands, Portugal, the United Kingdom, Greece, Spain, Czech



working together a complex task. The overlap in some members but not others complicates their ability to co-operate and has further deterred them from establishing a permanent solution for the Ukrainian conflict.

### **Behind the Agenda(s)/Strategies**

The differing organizational structures and bureaucratic procedures<sup>11</sup> of NATO and the EU are the first major reasons the actors have had difficulty in agreeing upon a solution to the Russia-Ukraine conflict in the past three years. The second reason their strategies have fallen short of success can be seen in the contrasting motives and stakes that each agent possesses. Both the EU and NATO have separate, yet at times, similar interests that composed their agendas when responding to the crisis. In “Case of Ukraine and Interests of the Major Players”, Crina Soroiu claims that the varied interests of these key players act as imbedded limitations to reaching a solution (2014). These interests can be divided into three spheres I have composed: economic, political, and security. In light of the Russia-Ukraine crisis, the EU and NATO differ mostly in the political realm, but do share similarities in their economic and security-related concerns. These shared or separate qualms also serve to explain why the EU and NATO chose divergent strategies that ultimately failed because they were tailored to their own respective interests, rather than on compromising their approaches to best resolve the crisis.

Through an economical lens, both actors have common interests of protecting the economies of their member states and securing many nations’ reliance on Russia for gas. The EU’s reliance on Russia’s gas is significant, as 29% of member states’ oil was imported from Republic, Poland, Hungary, Latvia, Lithuania, Estonia, Malta, Poland, Slovakia, Slovenia and Croatia.

<sup>11</sup> Refers to NATO’s and EU’s adverse committees that I spoke of earlier, like the EU’s CFSP and NATO’s Foreign Ministers, that were created to handle foreign policy matters. The bureaucratic procedures refer to the differing methods those committees use to create options or solutions that their organization can enact.

Russia in 2014 (Eurostat, 2016). This factor, for example, led the EU several times to employ forceful sanctions, freezing of assets, and travel bans on Russia because many of its members hesitated to use harsher tactics, in fear that their economies would suffer or their petroleum supply would be cut off, leading people to die during the winter (Timeline - EU Restrictive Measures...). During the following months after the annexation of Crimea, the EU slowly responded to its best interests by implementing economic and trade sanctions incrementally, and deciding to “suspend bilateral talks” with Russia in the meantime (Timeline - EU Restrictive Measures...).<sup>12</sup> The European Union’s response to the events of the crisis reflect its economic concerns that withheld it from responding with the necessary force needed to solve the crisis, and instead caused it to take a ‘tip-toe’ approach in response to Russia’s violations.

Additionally, Soroiu states that the EU’s choice for soft power approaches, like the various economic sanctions it imposed on Russia, has more to do with the “unequal military capabilities of member states and the lack of consensus on the definition of defense within the organization” (2014, pg. 119). In addition to this argument, scholar Morena Skalamera, in “The Ukraine Crisis: The Neglected Gas Factor”, points out that while the EU is generally successful in using soft power to deter crises and appease conflicts, this time, its complex foreign policy process and interests at stake disabled its usual strategies from working (2015). She further describes that, “...while the EU is better positioned in terms of soft power, its inherent structural deficiencies have prevented the EU, thus far, from deploying consistent and tangible influence abroad” (Skalamera, 2015).

---

<sup>12</sup> A specific layout of day-to-day meetings, agreements, and actions taken by the EU’s foreign policy actors can be found at <http://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/policies/sanctions/ukraine-crisis/history-ukraine-crisis/>.

Similarly, in this case, NATO took an according stance on the issue since many of its members – especially the 22 belonging to both agencies – felt strongly about guarding their economies from any extra effects the approaches would have. Thus, following the annexation of Crimea and the official escalation in the crisis, NATO responded strategically to its interests as well, by “endorsing additional measures to bolster Ukraine’s self-defense capability” on June 25, 2014, and deciding to “suspend all practical military and civilian cooperation with Russia” on March 31, 2014 (Nuclear Threat Initiative (NTI), 2016). Their similar responses to the crisis after the Crimea incident reveals their shared concerns, in this instance, over their members’ economies.

While the EU and NATO had similar motives in an economic sense, politically, their responses to the Russia-Ukraine crisis varied due to their diverging interests at stake. In the political realm, the actors’ antagonistic strategies were based more on the struggle for power and influence in the sphere. In “NATO and the Ukraine Crisis”, Michael Rühle claims that many people believed that the crisis would be NATO’s ‘comeback’, a means to rise as a major presence in European affairs again (2015, pg. 81). I argue that while this political theory may not hold merit, the perception of it may have influenced the way NATO responded to the crisis. Additionally, the vast political interests that NATO had, induced their decision to not respond militarily because they assessed that the costs were too high since Ukraine is not a member of either agency and they believed that Russia’s military was still underdeveloped (Rühle, 2015, 81-82).

On the other hand, politically, the EU was more interested in allying with Ukraine and encouraging its development as a democracy, leading them to work directly with Ukraine – without NATO’s involvement – by ratifying the EU-Ukraine Association Agreement on June 27,

2014 (Lironi, 2015, pg. 4). The EU's reasoning for this action stemmed from its motivation to have a stable neighbor and political buffer from Russia's ideology. Policy Officer, Elisa Lironi, further confirms this notion by pointing out that since the onset of the crisis, "the EU has strengthened its relations with Ukraine, condemned Russia's behavior in the annexation of Crimea...However, it has been unable to push Russia to withdraw its troops from eastern Ukraine and to completely respect the ceasefire, nor to negotiate a stable long-term solution for the country and the region" (2015, pg. 1). This, again, reveals how the actor behaved according to its interests when responding to the crisis and thus inhibiting its ability to show legitimacy as a foreign policy actor.

Security-wise, NATO's and the EU's concerns align somewhat. While both bodies wanted to de-escalate the situation and appease the violence on both ends, their biggest difference lies in the United States' substantial influence as a major contributing member to NATO's defense budget, causing them to have significant sway in NATO's agenda towards the crisis. Their shared troubles factor in through the lacking consensus amongst each of the organizations' members, in part, explaining the difficulty they have had in cooperating to resolve the conflict. For example, in "NATO: Response to the Crisis in Ukraine and Security Concerns in Central and Eastern Europe\*", authors Paul Belkin, Derek Mix, and Steven Woehrel suggest that NATO's inability to resolve the Russia-Ukraine crisis comes from internal division between the members: "...within Europe, some allies have emphasized the need for territorial defense capabilities, while others have stressed the importance of more flexible, rapidly deployable units and civilian-military crisis management operations" (2014, pg. 284). Similarly, Rühle states that it has been difficult for NATO to implement a working solution because the agency is torn between protecting its members from Russia while also wanting to build some level of rapport or

civility with them (2015, pg. 80). These divisions help explain to the public the stakes at hand for major foreign policy actors and why the politics behind any decision they make most likely reflects their motives, rather than their character.

Additionally, the European Union's apprehensions regarding security mirror NATO's in the divisive nature of the organization. Their concern for the security of the member states in the East compelled the EU to struggle in composing effective strategies as they attempted to balance internal divisiveness and a mix of governance. In "From EU Governance of Crisis to Crisis of EU Governance: Regulatory Failure, Redistributive Conflict and Eurosceptic Publics\*", scholar Tanja Börzel mentions, "Some even argue that the EU has not only failed to provide solutions but that is actually part of the problem undermining the capacity of its Member States to effectively and democratically govern their markets and societies in the 21<sup>st</sup> century" (2016, pg. 8). She further criticizes that the EU, as a foreign policy actor, shows relative weakness in handling crises because of its combination of national and supranational governance (2016). The overlap in governance and internal flaws of the EU have contributed to the various interests at play, which in turn, made it problematic for the EU to propose solutions that were less entailed to its members' interests and more focused on the threats the conflict posed. This behind-the-scenes layout of the politics involved in the EU's and NATO's making of foreign policy lays the foundation to explore the reasons their respective strategies failed to resolve the conflict.

### **Evaluation of Strategies**

The EU and NATO's alternate organizational structures, varying interests and oftentimes conflicting agendas help to explain their difficulty in resolving the Ukraine crisis even three years after its commencement. At first glance, when examining the strategies NATO used, its initial responses were in line with my original expectations of it reacting with aggressive policies

and hard power because of its pre-determined nature. For example, in 2014, NATO's airborne warning and control system increased their surveillance over Ukraine and eastern countries like Romania and Poland (Belkin et al., pg. 285) despite their 'softer'<sup>13</sup> approaches taken later on. They also contemplated more upfront policies, such as expanding the deployment of naval and ground forces over the Baltic States (Belkin et al., 2014, pg. 285-86), but the shift in NATO's policies was again due to the division amongst member-states' interests discussed earlier, which led them to fail. NATO's struggle to maintain its hard power approach was also for geopolitical reasons. Belkin et al. argue that allies in Eastern and Central Europe supported stronger military policies, as they were more exposed to the violence caused because of the conflict, while other allies "cautioned against a "militarization" of NATO relations with Russia", fearing the consequences of any rash military actions (2014, pg. 286). Therefore, while NATO's original reactions to the crisis were more aggressive, as the conflict developed, the actor's policies transformed to reflect its member-states' objectives.

Additionally, the EU originally responded to the crisis by using a diplomatic approach, for example, adopting the EU-Ukraine Association Agreement in June 2014 (Lironi, 2015, pg. 4), which was a symbolic use of soft power to support Ukraine politically and economically, without directly threatening Russia militarily for its actions. Initially, the EU considered a soft approach because of its members' reliance on Russian gas and trade (Reid, 2015, pg. 293), but I argue that this weak response to the crisis set the tone for its future strategies, which albeit became stronger, were not sufficient to be effective solutions. The EU's reactive nature to the situation deterred it from being in control and thus made its policies less successful. Towards the beginning of the crisis, the EU did not opt for a proactive approach, but instead reacted to Russia

---

<sup>13</sup> Referring to less militaristic strategies.

and Ukraine's escalated actions. The Council of the EU and the European Council adopted over thirty restrictive measures since early 2014, which called for imposing sanctions, expanding bans on travel and imported goods, cancelling any bilateral summit talks, etc. (Timeline – Restrictive Measures...). Eventually with time passing and no real change in the situation, the policies adapted to address the costs at stake for the parties involved. Thus, like NATO, the EU's shift in strategy is also attributed to its members' adverse motives and lack of initiative. While these initial strategies reflect the international agents' respective characters, the unfolding of agendas and events that proceeded after the crisis reinforces my theory that the motives and stakes of each actor influenced their strategies towards the conflict; therefore, causing the conflict to remain unresolved.

Prior to looking into the EU and NATO's respective motives, I hypothesized that each actor would have responded to the crisis in alignment with its 'character' and pre-disposed missions for being created; that is, the EU employing diplomatic strategies, avoiding military action, and using overall soft power to approach the conflict, while conversely predicting NATO to have used aggressive militaristic policies and depicting more of a hard power-focused strategy. While this is not an entirely wrong perspective, when one takes into account each of the agent's motives and capabilities, some of the research proves otherwise. For example, scholar Michael Rühle (2015) argues that NATO's agenda appropriately explains its response to the Russia-Ukraine conflict by tailoring its approach as a strategic one catering to the agent's own security-related interests.

Contrary to my initial belief, Rühle claims that NATO's response to the crisis was "low-key", rather than confrontational, because the risks of attacking or invading were not worth the costs of officially labelling Russia as a threat and enemy, and thus, completely shutting the door

on a diplomatic solution (2015, pg. 82). This finding suggests that while I expected the EU and NATO to react differently to foreign affair matters because of their structure and member-nations, the nature of their respective interests actually has more weight in determining their foreign policy decisions, rather than the character of each organization. In the Russia-Ukraine case, NATO's cost-analysis led it to enact the Readiness Action Plan (RAP) at the Wales Summit; unlike the EU, who stuck with economic sanctions and perpetual negotiations to broker a ceasefire. While the RAP reads as a military plan, it is actually more of a preventative plan,<sup>14</sup> further proving this paper's argument that EU's and NATO's respective policies have continuously failed to resolve the crisis because their approaches were more focused on their own interests and capabilities, instead of strategically working together to implement a sustainable solution.

### **Solutions for EU and NATO & the Russia-Ukraine Crisis or Repetitive Cycles?**<sup>15</sup>

Many scholars have proposed a multitude of future solutions to deal with the infamous Russia-Ukraine crisis. Scholars Laura Van Metre, Viola Gienger, and Kathleen Kuehast in "The Ukraine-Russia Conflict Signals and Scenarios for the Broader Region", suggest that international organizations should provide an abundance of support through cultural, political, and economic means (2015). Such support for Ukraine could involve trade incentives, technological support, pushing of Western values, and military aid (Van Metre et al., 2015, pg. 366-67). Some scholars suggest that member nations ween off their dependency on Russia for gas (Skalamera, 2015); whereas, others propose offering Ukraine a Membership Action Plan

---

<sup>14</sup> The RAP calls for "Assurance Measures" and "Adaptive Measures" that vaguely outline NATO's reforms such as, "Enhancing the NATO Response Force (NRF) to make it more responsive and capable" (NATO's Readiness Action Plan, 2014, pg.1).

<sup>15</sup> A timeline of strategies employed by both the EU and NATO post-Minsk Protocol and up to November 2016 can be found at <http://ukraine.csis.org/#0>.



(MAP) through NATO (Rühle, 2015), or paving the way to integrate Ukraine into the EU (Lironi, 2015). But through the proposal of future solutions for the crisis, author Reid makes an excellent case in that future solutions, again, will only go so far as to reflect the interests of the parties involved, as I have depicted with NATO's and the EU's respective agendas. Reid states, "But even if we care about Ukraine only in so far as it affects our own security, there are good arguments for standing by the country. The stronger, richer and better-governed Ukraine is, the more resistant it will be to Russian aggression, and the greater will be its ability to come to the help of neighbours if Putin launches vandalistic sorties elsewhere" (2015, pg. 294).

On the other hand, NATO and the EU have been attempting to work together since the early 1990s in the hopes of preparing for the effective management of crisis operations, creating a unified defense, and easing their ability to cooperate. Through their differences and battle to remain relevant, their agendas and goals have oftentimes conflicted, as we have seen in the case of the Russia-Ukraine crisis. Many scholars have composed theories and proposed remedies for NATO and the EU's future in crisis management. For instance, author Nicole Koenig in "The EU and NATO: Towards a Joint Future in Crisis Management?" cautiously proposes future scenarios for the EU and NATO to work together on future crises. Such cases include, the EU "revert[ing] to its original status as a civilian power" and NATO alone taking over the security realm, or combining the two agents' capabilities and structure to form one unit (Koenig, 2010, pg. 20-22). At the same time though, many scholars are skeptical of the EU's and NATO's ability to work together when the lines of their responsibilities and characters are increasingly blurred, and the actors are progressively focused on their own agendas when addressing crises. Margriet Drent, author of "EU-NATO Relations in Crisis Management Operations: The Practice of Informality", interestingly proposes that the overlapping features of the EU and NATO and

their sometimes common goals ironically lead to an inability to collaborate in producing effective foreign policy (2015). She also determines that crisis management, such as the one I have been addressing, often exacerbates the relationship between the two actors and questions their overlapping jurisdiction (2015). The Russia-Ukraine crisis embodies these theories, revealing the difficulty the EU and NATO have had in composing strategies and cooperating on their approaches to resolve the conflict.

The problem with these suggested solutions are that they do not take into account the collaboration between the EU and NATO and the costs associated with the strategies proposed to resolve the crisis. Rühle and Soroiu point out some of the inherent consequences these strategies have had, leading them to be ineffective. For example, Rühle discusses the lack of funds and personnel needed to enact NATO's RAP plan (2015), while Soroiu delineates the issue of rising hostility and threatening Russia's sphere of influence in the region by having the EU and/or NATO intervene militarily (2014). While I agree with some of the strategies proposed, I believe that a combination of hard and soft policies, along with a consensus by both the EU and NATO to commit to implementing the policies for the future of the crisis, will be the best steps moving forward.

Although a detailed proposal of suggestions is outside the scope of this paper, it is rather imperative to acknowledge why the previous strategies or policies employed have failed. In "Ukraine and the Minsk II Agreement: On a Frozen Path to Peace?", author Naja Bentzen appropriately explains why the crisis is far from resolved, even after the passing and extending of the Minsk II Agreement<sup>16</sup> in February 2015, which called for the latest ceasefire and withdrawal

---

<sup>16</sup> A full outline of the measures the Minsk II Agreement calls for can be found at <http://www.elysee.fr/assets/Uploads/Package-of-Measures-for-the-Implementation-of-the-Minsk-Agreements.pdf>.

of weapons after a violation of the Minsk Protocol<sup>17</sup> (2016, pg. 1-2).<sup>18</sup> Bentzen's argument supports my own because she states that each ceasefire has been followed by continuous fighting, another ceasefire, and then temporary relief (2016). This cycle shows the lack of successful efforts by both the EU and NATO in working together to manage the Russia-Ukraine crisis. Additionally, Bentzen claims that while the conflict may not significantly escalate in the future, it is a disaster that is being overlooked, "Several unresolved issues will continue to pose challenges to the fulfilment of Minsk II in 2016. The death toll has now surpassed 9,000, and Russia continues to supply the rebels with ammunition, weaponry and fighters...At the same time, the practical consequences of the conflict are tangible in the rebel-held areas, where a humanitarian crisis is unfolding" (2016, pg. 1). This further explains the ineffectiveness of the policies NATO and the EU have used because of the politics behind their foreign policy-making. It also proves the urgency in resolving this ongoing conflict to address the violence and humanitarian concerns at the core of the crisis.

## **Conclusion**

While some argue that the EU and NATO have become interchangeable in their roles, and others may claim the Ukrainian crisis is resolved, this paper delineates that this may not be the case since we have seen the actors' contrasting motives and agendas at stake in the crisis and how this has hindered them from cooperating to establish a functional and permanent solution. Dr. Hanna Ojanen in "Theories at a Loss? EU–NATO Fusion and the "Low Politicisation" of

---

<sup>17</sup> The components delineated in the Minsk Protocol can be found at <http://mfa.gov.ua/en/news-feeds/foreign-offices-news/27596-protocol-on-the-results-of-consultations-of-the-trilateral-contact-group-minsk-05092014>.

<sup>18</sup> The first drafted ceasefire was the Minsk Protocol on September 5, 2014 but it was never implemented because the measures were violated and violence continued throughout 2015; thus, Ukraine, Russia, France, and Germany brokered the Minsk II Agreement in February 2015 and later on extended it into 2016 (Bentzen, 2016, pg. 1-3).

Security and Defence in European Integration” largely argues that, “At times, it would even seem as if the organisations would swap identities: NATO would become a political organisation, while the EU would become a military one. The new overlap implied that there was a need to find rules and roles, if not altogether a real division of labour between the organisations in crisis management” (pg. 13). Ojanen brings up a valid query that supports my argument because the analyzed case study of the Russia-Ukraine conflict proves that the EU and NATO have not been successful in resolving the issue because their ‘characters’ as organizations have changed and their motives and interests have become more important than their identities in crafting foreign policy decisions.

The EU’s economic sanctions, passive aggressive strategies, travel bans, asset freezes, cancelling of summits, overall use of soft power, and NATO’s precaution-focused strategies, pledging of troops and supplies, RAP, and attempt at ‘back-door diplomacy’, acted more as a ‘band-aid’ to the crisis instead of a permanent solution. NATO Secretary General Rasmussen highlights the significance of the ongoing conflict and was quoted in 2014 saying that the Russia-Ukraine crisis was “the most serious crisis in Europe since the fall of the Berlin Wall” (Belkin et al., pg. 284), yet unfortunately two years later, both international organizations have failed in fully addressing it.

There are many new questions to be addressed in the near future, which the literature does not attend to. For example, do NATO and the EU manage crises as their original roles for creation intended or do they respond based on their members’ needs and motives? In order to answer such a question, one would need to look beyond the case study of the Russia-Ukraine crisis at many other crises that both the EU and NATO have been active in. Additionally, are intergovernmental organizations, like NATO and the EU, effective in handling global crises?

Again, in order to establish some sort of answer, future research needs to consider the roles each actor has played in past crises and what kind of impact they may have had on the outcomes of those situations. Such gaps in the literature should guide the direction of forthcoming research and further delve into the politics behind the making of foreign policy, which has proven to be a significant aspect in global crises.

While those types of questions were not covered here, this paper has explored the politics behind EU and NATO foreign policy-making through the case of the Russia-Ukraine crisis. It has determined that the motives and interests of both actors, rather than the nature of the organizations, had more influence on the approaches taken towards the conflict. It further concluded that their organizational make-up, procedures, and overlapping members combined with their separate agendas concerning the crisis, ultimately explains how and why the EU and NATO chose their respective strategies. I addressed some of the EU's and NATO's respective – economic, political, and security – motives that led them to choose their divergent strategies, ranging from a use of hard and soft power. Ultimately, this paper included an evaluation of the international agents' enacted policies towards the Russia-Ukraine crisis, an explanation of their failure to cooperate in their approaches, and a suggestion of proposed solutions as a combination of strategies that should be cultivated and executed by having the EU and NATO work together to resolve this prevalent issue.

## Bibliography

- A Short History of NATO. (2012). 1-8. Retrieved from [http://www.nato.int/nato\\_static\\_fl2014/assets/pdf/pdf\\_publications/20120412\\_ShortHistory\\_en.pdf](http://www.nato.int/nato_static_fl2014/assets/pdf/pdf_publications/20120412_ShortHistory_en.pdf).
- Belkin, P., Mix, D. E., & Woehrel, S. (2014). NATO: Response to the Crisis in Ukraine and Security Concerns in Central and Eastern Europe\*. *Current Politics and Economics of Russia, Eastern and Central Europe*, 29(2), 281-304. Retrieved from <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1654706534?accountid=10920>.
- Bentzen, N. (January 2016). Ukraine and the Minsk II Agreement: On a Frozen Path to Peace? *European Parliamentary Research Service*, 1-8. European Union. Retrieved from [http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/BRIE/2016/573951/EPRS\\_BRI\(2016\)573951\\_EN.pdf](http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/BRIE/2016/573951/EPRS_BRI(2016)573951_EN.pdf).
- Börzel, T. A. (2016) From EU Governance of Crisis to Crisis of EU Governance: Regulatory Failure, Redistributive Conflict and Eurosceptic Publics. *JCMS: Journal of Common Market Studies*, 54, 8–31. doi: [10.1111/jcms.12431](https://doi.org/10.1111/jcms.12431).
- Drent, M. (2015). EU-NATO Relations in Crisis Management Operations: The Practice of Informality. In M. R. Freire & M. G. Galantino (Eds.), *Managing Crises, Making Peace*, 91-110. Palgrave Macmillan. Retrieved from Springer Link. doi: [10.1057/9781137442253\\_5](https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137442253_5).
- Eurostat. (September 2016). Energy Production and Imports. Retrieved from [http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php/Energy\\_production\\_and\\_imports#Further\\_Eurostat\\_information](http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php/Energy_production_and_imports#Further_Eurostat_information).
- Genderen, W. T., & Legrand, J. (2016, September). Foreign Policy: Aims, Instruments and Achievements. Retrieved from [http://www.europarl.europa.eu/atyourservice/en/displayFtu.html?ftuId=FTU\\_6.1.1.html](http://www.europarl.europa.eu/atyourservice/en/displayFtu.html?ftuId=FTU_6.1.1.html).
- Gienger, V. G., Kuehnast, K., & Van Metre, L. (March 2015). The Ukraine-Russia Conflict Signals and Scenarios for the Broader Region. *United States Institute of Peace Special Report 366*, 1-14. Retrieved from <https://ciao.cdrs.columbia.edu/attachments/27847/uploads?1438533331>.
- Koenig, N. (November 2010). The EU and NATO: Towards a Joint Future in Crisis Management? *EU Diplomacy Papers*, 1-34. Retrieved from [file:///Users/haileybecker/Downloads/edp\\_11\\_2010\\_koenig.pdf](file:///Users/haileybecker/Downloads/edp_11_2010_koenig.pdf).
- Lironi, E. (May 2015). The Ukrainian Crisis: Lessons for the EU's Foreign and Defence Policy. *The Union of European Federalists Reflection Paper*, 1-8. Retrieved from [http://www.federalists.eu/fileadmin/files\\_uef/Publications/Reflection\\_Paper/The\\_Ukrainian\\_Crisis\\_Lessons\\_for\\_EUs\\_Foreign\\_and\\_Defence\\_Policy.pdf](http://www.federalists.eu/fileadmin/files_uef/Publications/Reflection_Paper/The_Ukrainian_Crisis_Lessons_for_EUs_Foreign_and_Defence_Policy.pdf).

- Mearsheimer, J. J. (2014). Why the Ukraine Crisis is the West's Fault: The Liberal Delusions that Provoked Putin. *Foreign Aff.*, 93, 77.
- MH17 tragedy draws eyes to Russia-Ukraine conflict ... (2014, July 18). Retrieved from <http://www.monash.edu/news/articles/mh17-tragedy-draws-eyes-to-russia-ukraine-conflict>.
- NATO Organization (2016, July 27). Retrieved from <http://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/structure.htm#OA>.
- NATO's Readiness Action Plan (2014). [Fact Sheet]. Retrieved from [http://www.nato.int/nato\\_static\\_fl2014/assets/pdf/pdf\\_2014\\_12/20141202\\_141202-factsheet-rap-en.pdf](http://www.nato.int/nato_static_fl2014/assets/pdf/pdf_2014_12/20141202_141202-factsheet-rap-en.pdf).
- NTI. (July 2016). North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO). Retrieved from <http://www.nti.org/learn/treaties-and-regimes/north-atlantic-treaty-organization-nato/>.
- Ojanen, H. (2002) Theories at a Loss? EU–NATO Fusion and the “Low Politicisation” of Security and Defence in European Integration. Finnish Institute of International Affairs, Helsinki. Retrieved from <https://ciao-dev.cdrs.columbia.edu/catalog/1258>.
- Pifer, S., & Thoburn, H. (2014, July 17). A New Tragedy in Ukraine: The Shootdown of Malaysian ... Retrieved from <https://www.brookings.edu/blog/up-front/2014/07/17/a-new-tragedy-in-ukraine-the-shutdown-of-malaysian-airlines-flight-17/>.
- Reid, A. (2015). *Borderland: A Journey Through The History Of Ukraine* [Revised]. Retrieved from [https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=1VTqCAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PR8&dq=history+of+ukraine+russia+crisis&ots=par4XNh\\_GT&sig=uWLJYmr0VFgJxesXMdcXOWZqznU#v=onepage&q=history%20of%20ukraine%20russia%20crisis&f=false](https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=1VTqCAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PR8&dq=history+of+ukraine+russia+crisis&ots=par4XNh_GT&sig=uWLJYmr0VFgJxesXMdcXOWZqznU#v=onepage&q=history%20of%20ukraine%20russia%20crisis&f=false).
- Rühle, M. (2015). NATO and the Ukraine Crisis. *American Foreign Policy Interests*, 37(2), 80-86. doi:10.1080/10803920.2015.1038925.
- Skalamera, M. (2015). The Ukraine Crisis: The Neglected Gas Factor. *Orbis*, 59(3), 398-410. doi: 10.1016/j.orbis.2015.05.002.
- Soroiu, C. (2014). Case of Ukraine and Interests of the Major Players. *Research and Science Today*, (2), 118-125. Retrieved from <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1657580997?accountid=10920>.
- Timeline - EU Restrictive Measures in Response to the Crisis in Ukraine. (n.d.). Retrieved from <http://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/policies/sanctions/ukraine-crisis/history-ukraine-crisis/>.

Ukraine crisis: Timeline - BBC News. (2014, November 13). *BBC News*. Retrieved from <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-middle-east-26248275>.

What is NATO? (n.d.). Retrieved from <http://www.nato.int/nato-welcome/>.



## **Family Planning 2020: Barriers to Success in South Africa**

**By Jaclyn Brenner**

FamilyPlanning2020 (FP2020), established at the 2012 London Summit on Family Planning, seeks to promote the right of women to govern their own sexual health by expanding access and use of contraception, providing post-partum health services, and mobilizing local and state governments to recognize the importance of family planning. The FP2020 global partnership stems from the recent international initiative to refocus sustainable development policies with family planning at the core. Family planning propels sustainability, assisting in the achievement of Millennium Development Goals through bolstering universal education, advancing gender equality, and reducing poverty, maternal and child mortality rates, and HIV/AIDS transmission rates (Chola, et al. 2015, 2). After failing to meet the 2015 Millennium Development Goals deadline, South Africa has shifted their sustainability strategies to mirror those of the international community, committing to FP2020 in 2012. South Africa presents a unique case, being the only FP2020 focus country with a reported per capita GNI of over \$2,500, the World Bank standard of lower to lower middle incomes, at the inception of the program (FP2020 2015, 17). Inconsistent with its relatively high per capita GNI, South Africa retains its status as a focus country due to internal factors impeding previous success of family planning. The most significant barriers to the success of FP2020 in South Africa include the HIV/AIDS pandemic, the inadequacy of health facilities, and cultural dynamics.

Despite South Africa's present status as an upper middle income, relatively developed state, its success remains hindered by the prevalence of HIV/AIDs. The second president of South Africa, Thabo Mbeki, could not shed the fetters of imperialism, convoluting racist ideology with the AIDS pandemic. His government, spanning the majority of the first decade of

the twenty-first century, marked stagnation in medical progress. Mbeki's core beliefs included a refusal of the fundamental correlation between HIV and AIDS, not purely on a scientific basis, but also on a cultural basis. President Mbeki rebuked the notions of AIDS as an African disease, caused and perpetuated by African people and African sexuality, as they acknowledged Western stereotypes of a filthy, barbaric people and "the pornographic spectacle of blackness" (Hoad 2005, 118). Mbeki's opposition to medical treatment, specifically antiretroviral drugs, reflected a history of exploitation by Western corporations and ideology, abusing both the people, and their underdeveloped markets. During his term, government-run health facilities were discouraged, and often prohibited, from the distribution of antiretroviral drugs, even when supplied by the South African Ministry of Health. In 2001, the South African government also refused to supply pregnant women with Nevirapine, a drug proven to significantly reduce mother-baby HIV transmissions. During Mbeki's presidency, South Africa lagged significantly behind comparatively unstable and undeveloped countries of Uganda and Botswana in terms of AIDS treatment and prevention (Hoad 2005, 103).

However, upon donning the former president's post-colonial shroud, the associations of AIDS with shaming Western notions of barbaric sexuality, of new antiretroviral drugs with human drug testing, and of foreign aid with foreign dominance, appear less hyperbolic. Among Western literature describing the AIDS pandemic, there is a prevalence of misrepresentation of African culture as barbaric, teeming with rape and hyper-sexuality, serving as an explanation for the disease. This connotation advances imperialist notions of Western superiority through the employment of racial and sexual stereotypes. Mbeki viewed poverty both as South Africa's, and the majority of the Global South's, most pressing issue, and as a partial root of AIDS. The international aid regime, from his perspective, elected to focus on AIDS, however, as solving

that particular issue proved profitable. Pharmaceutical companies have not only profited directly from sales of expensive treatments, but indirectly through the use of African people as test subjects for drugs such as Virodene, the toxic precursor to modern antiretroviral drugs (Wang 2008, 2-7). With this knowledge, Mbeki's claims of neo-imperial influence on international responses to the pandemic cannot reasonably be dismissed. Nonetheless, in the face of such dire circumstances, the post-colonial shroud has become synonymous with an alibi. Mbeki's critique disregards non-profit organizations, NGOs, and grassroots efforts with no relation to pharmaceutical companies and the profits they may pursue. While there are those still trapped in the mindset of imperialism, there are also those progressing toward altruistic global assistance. In the face of change, Mbeki chose to align with those still trapped. As opposed to securing the future of his people, he remained encumbered by fetters of the past (Hoad 2005, 19).

The African National Congress ousted President Thabo Mbeki in 2008. In the four years between the end of his term and South Africa's commitment to FP2020, current president, Jacob Zuma, had committed the country to a new AIDS initiative. Zuma aimed to have fifteen million South Africans tested for HIV and be provided with proper counseling in 2010. In an effort to both prove his dedication to the acknowledgement and alleviation of the AIDS pandemic, and clear his name of potential sexual allegations, the president publically announced his HIV negative status while introducing his initiative to the people (Hunter-Gualt 2010). Although his transparency may serve as a model to some, results of his initiative are less than ideal. As reported by the Pretoria Department of Health, approximately 10,000 new HIV cases were reported between 2012 and 2016 (Mashamba-Thompson 2016). Though this statistic may be the result of increased testing, a facet of Zuma's initiative, the pandemic clearly persists. Currently,

HIV is responsible for forty percent of South African maternal deaths and twenty five percent of all death of children under five (Chola, et al. 2015, 2-6).

FP2020 places contraception at the core of their development strategy. Contraception is hailed in family planning circles, as it allows for pregnancy spacing, which results in safer, more successful pregnancies. Fewer, safer pregnancies, translate into better quality of life for both mother and child regarding education, decreased risk of poverty, and advancement of gender equality (Chola, et al. 2015, 2). While increased access to contraception is a preeminent solution for some FP2020 commitment makers, due to the prevalence of HIV/AIDS, South Africa presents a distinct challenge. Contraception has been proven in AIDS-affected countries to reduce the rate of infant transmission due to unintended pregnancy at similar levels to Nevirapine intervention (Sweat, et al. 2004). Modern contraceptives, in addition to their equivalent success rate, are significantly more cost-effective than Nevirapine or other antiretroviral drugs, and have been viewed as solutions to South Africa's high maternal mortality and infant transmission rates (Marlow, et al. 2014). Contraceptive use for HIV positive women as a means of limiting infant transmission only succeeds in cases of unintended pregnancy. This application of contraception ignores the larger issue of infant transmission in intended pregnancies, which requires antiretroviral medication to terminate the perpetuation of the pandemic.

Consideration of contraception as a substitute to antiretroviral drugs reveals the obstacle of underdeveloped health facilities, which cannot provide necessary multicomponent intervention to secure the health of the people they serve. The South Africa HIV Antenatal Post-test Support Study (SAHAPS), conducted jointly by the University of KwaZulu Natal and the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, exposed the challenges faced by health facilities in providing proper post-partum family planning services. Through interviews with eight HIV

positive clients, six HIV negative clients, and five nurses, researchers were able to ascertain the specific problems that significantly hinder the success of the facilities. Preeminent among these is the unreliability of staff availability and education. According to the interviews, each nurse saw approximately twenty to thirty patients per day. As each day progressed, nurses had significantly less time to spend with each patient; therefore clients arriving earlier in the day received better treatment. This matter of timing served to the detriment of working clients, or those who must travel far distances. Moreover, three out of five nurses said the women must be menstruating when they come to initiate a family planning method to prove that they are not pregnant, which further limits the scope of access to family planning resources. Due to staff scarcity, nurses often lack the time to properly treat patients and listen to their concerns, and patients often fear asking important questions at the risk of wasting nurses' time. Only five out of fourteen women interviewed reported that nurses sat them down and explained possible side effects and functions of injectable contraceptives before administering doses. This explanation is critical, as injectable contraception was only introduced in South African health facilities in 2014 (Marlow, et al. 2014). As evidenced by the interviews conducted, South African health facilities' inability to meet the needs of local women stems from the fundamental incapacity for the supply of educated nurses to meet the overwhelming need of the population.

For FP2020 specifically, it is difficult to report change or quantify the difference their influence has made, as data on statistics, such as contraceptive use and percentage of use per contraceptive method, has not been reported since the 2003 Demographic and Health Survey (DHS). FP2020 is responding to the dearth of information in commitment-making countries by organizing health data consensus workshops with the countries' ministries of health (FP2020 2015, 23). The main functions of these data workshops, however, are to analyze available data,

and mobilize the use of this data in national policy decisions. Having to account first for a fundamental data deficit, the absolute efficacy of these workshops would be deferred until relevant and recent data can be properly provided.

FP2020's focus on securing the reproductive rights of women is a significant step toward sustainable growth and gender equality; however, in South Africa, it would serve as the first of many necessary steps. Although rated by Freedom House as possessing freedom in the world, press, and Internet, the nongovernmental organization recognizes the country's subjugation of women to gender-based violence. Freedom house has called upon President Zuma to address this culture of violence and listen to the grievances of South African women (Freedom House 2016). The prevalence and perpetuation of acts of violence in these regions, specifically gender-based intimate partner violence, are resultant of a culture of honor. Cultures of honor emerge from poverty-stricken, patriarchal societies, where men lack material possessions with which to prove their worth, and must rely on their honor, their socially constructed status symbol, to preserve their societal standing. Aggression in cultures of honor is a reaction and outlet of shame, a consequence of meager material wealth, and often projected on subjugated groups, specifically women (van der Merwe and Swartz 2014, 196).

Although there is no ambiguity regarding imperialism's interruption of African culture, there is discord regarding the defining factors of contemporary culture. Within South Africa exist movements to return the country to its pre-colonial state. While these movements serve to honor traditional aspects of South African culture, they often seek to restore traditions that reverse societal progression, such as virginity testing and patriarchal hierarchies.

Traditional virginity testing, a gynecological exam to determine whether a young woman's hymen is intact, although seemingly invasive, allowed women in pre-colonial South

Africa relative autonomy over their bodies (DePalma and Francis 2014, 2008). Once a young woman's virginity status was determined, it could be used as evidence for a rape allegation, and a means of encouraging consensual sexual activity. Results from virginity tests in the pre-colonial era were more often tools for protection against rape than for punishment of illicit pre-marital relations. In this traditional society, although the majority of power was relegated to men, older women possessed the power over regulating sexuality, as they possessed the authority over women's bodies by conducting the majority of examinations (Thornberry 2015, 131). Under colonial authority, white men took charge of the courts, changing the traditional assumption of men's responsibility for sexual assault to one of skepticism of women's claims regarding their own bodies. As a result of these assumptions, only twenty-five percent of rape cases reported in King William's Town district where both parties were African resulted in a guilty verdict (Thornberry 2015, 139).

The revival of virginity testing is argued by some as a revival of custom, increasingly important to many South African people following the era of apartheid. It is also viewed as a solution to the shortage of evidence in contemporary rape cases, which results in largely inconclusive rulings, potentially perpetuating sexual violence (Thornberry 2015, 144). However, with both the contemporary prevalence of sexually transmitted infection and the introductions of victim blaming and cultures of honor, the revival of virginity testing would likely serve to perpetuate these gender discriminatory practices. Although virginity testing was once a preserver of women's authority over their bodies, societal progression has allowed for unprecedented autonomy, which supersedes and antiquates these traditional practices.

Revivals of traditional gender and social hierarchies have similar negative repercussions. Reinforcing patriarchal authority would give men false justification to commit gender-based

violence under the pretense of superiority. Assuming gender hierarchy under the guise of restoring South African customs, men in the community would exacerbate the current culture of honor. Restoring social hierarchies concurrently restores social taboos, resulting in silence and suppression (DePalma and Francis 2014, 548). This silence results in a discomfort in, and a lack of, sexual education both in and outside of schools. Due to the traditional denunciation of premarital sex, many educators presently feel discomfort when discussing matters of sexuality with young people, and similarly, many adolescents refrain from asking important questions out of fear. This suppression of sex education is impractical when faced with South Africa's high rates of HIV transmission and unintended pregnancy (DePalma and Francis 2014, 548). Sex educators are hindered by attempts to accommodate local tribal and religious practices regarding sexuality, but also by negative connotations of positive sex education with Western values or influence (DePalma and Francis 2014, 552). Some educators and students are reluctant to teach or learn this information, as it hails Western values over traditional practices. Given South Africa's colonial past, even family planning initiatives can be dismissed as intrusion of Western ideology.

Movements to restore traditional aspects of South African culture can be regarded as "destructive nostalgia," as people are attempting to construct a distant past in a changed world. In rebuilding culture, societal changes resultant of colonialism, however unwelcomed, cannot be ignored. Attempting to recreate South Africa, "destructive nostalgia" recaptures an impractical past. Instead, others endorse "reflective nostalgia," through which individuals assess specific aspects of traditional culture with the acknowledgement of societal changes, and select customs that are coherent with their vision for the country (DePalma and Francis 2014, 548). Under the



frame of “reflective nostalgia,” South Africa would be able to rebuild society incorporating traditional cultural values, while retaining a progressive path.

In attempting to secure a safer, empowered future for women in South Africa, FP2020 must incite a cultural change. Increasing and diversifying available contraception will only be successful when women are permitted to use it. The persistent culture of honor, and subsequent violence, limit women’s authority over their bodies. In order to ensure the success of their endeavors, the global partnership must work with local governments to provide safe shelters for women and children victims of intimate partner violence, and work with men in the community to reach a positive understanding of the benefits of birth spacing. In a society plagued with suppression of sexuality, contraception cannot be given to minors. Individuals can no longer silence the notion of pre-marital relations, or refuse to teach children positive sexual behavior, when twenty percent of girls ages fifteen to nineteen have reported at least one pregnancy (Chola, et al. 2015, 2). As the culture of South Africa is constantly evolving, FP2020 must constantly learn and listen to achieve its full potential.

South African history, from imperialism and apartheid, to freedom under Mandela, to stagnation under Mbeki, has underwritten the course of its present and future. Investing in this future, the South African government, under the direction of President Zuma, committed to FP2020 at the 2012 London Summit on Family Planning. South Africa, in aligning with the global partnership, aimed to achieve their Millennium Development Goals with a modified deadline, conceding five additional years. In deferring the deadline, the South African government acknowledged the significance of family planning in the pursuit of sustainable development, and empowered goals set forth by FP2020 to bolster the country’s progress. With a present and future bound with the past, FP2020 treads on the deep-rooted footholds of

imperialism regarding the HIV/AIDS pandemic, the inadequacy of health facilities and records, and the amalgamation of traditional and modern cultures. To provide South Africa with the tools necessary to progress as a society, FP2020 must adapt their strategy, currently focused on increasing access to multiple methods of contraception, to be more comprehensive. FP2020 must evolve to encompass more advanced medications, more educated and readily available medical staff, and an ability to learn from, and listen to the people. With less than four years before 2020, the global partnership must adapt to become the comprehensive, instrumental presence necessary to secure the productive future of South Africa.

## Works Cited

- Chola, McGee, et al. "Scaling Up Family Planning to Reduce Maternal and Child Mortality: The Potential Costs and Benefits of Modern Contraceptive Use in South Africa." *PLoS ONE*, vol. 10, no. 6, 2015, pp. 1-16.
- Cohen, D., et al. "The Sacred and the Social: Cultures of Honor and Violence." *Shame: Interpersonal Behavior, Psychopathology, and Culture*, edited by P. Gilbert & B. Andrews, Oxford University Press, 1998, New York, NY pp. 261–283.
- DePalma, Renee, and Dennis Francis. "Silence, Nostalgia, Violence, Poverty: What Does 'Culture' Mean for South African Sexuality Educators." *Culture, Health & Sexuality*. vol. 16, no. 5, 2014, pp.547-561.
- FP2020 Commitment to Action: Measurement Annex*. Family Planning 2020, Nov 2015.
- FP2020 Partnership in Action*. Family Planning 2020, 2013.
- Freedom House. *South Africa: Government Should Address 'Culture of Rape'*. Washington: Freedom House, 8 Aug 2016. Web.
- Hoad, Neville. "Thabo Mbeki's AIDS Blues: The Intellectual, the Archive, and the Pandemic." *Public Culture*. vol. 17, no. 1, 2005, pp. 101-127.
- Hunter-Gault, Charlayne. "The Third Man." *New Yorker*. vol. 86, no. 19, 2010, pp. 24-29.
- Marlow, Maman, et al. "Postpartum Family Planning Service Provision in Durban, South Africa: Client and Provider Perspectives." *Health Care for Women International*. vol. 35, no. 2, 2014, pp. 175-199.
- Mashamba-Thompson, Tivani P., et al. "Point-of-Care Diagnostics for Improving Maternal Health in South Africa." *Diagnostics*. vol. 6, no. 3, 2016, pp. 1-15.
- Rochat, Mkwanazi, et al. "Maternal HIV Disclosure to HIV-uninfected Children in Rural South Africa: A Pilot Study of A Family-Based Intervention." *BMC Public Health*. vol. 13, no. 1, 2013, pp. 1-16.
- South Africa: WHO Statistical Profile*. World Health Organization, Jan 2015.
- Sweat, Michael D., et al. "Cost-Effectiveness of Nevirapine to Prevent Mother-to-Child HIV Transmission in Eight African Countries." *AIDS*. vol. 18, no. 12, 2004, pp. 1661-1671.

Thornberry, Elizabeth. "Virginity Testing, History, and the Nostalgia For Custom in Contemporary South Africa." *African Studies Review*. vol. 58, no. 3, 2015, pp. 129-148.

Van der Merwe, Amelia, and Leslie Swartz. "Counter-Narratives in Context: The Role of the Organisation and Broader Culture in Psychic Splitting Among South African Survivors of Intimate Partner Violence." *Psychodynamic Practice*. vol. 20, no. 3, 2014, pp. 195-212.

Wang, Joy. "AIDS Denialism and "The Humanisation of the African." *Race & Class*. vol. 49 no. 3, 2008, pp. 1-18.

"What We Do." *Family Planning 2020*, 2016, [www.familyplanning2020.org/about](http://www.familyplanning2020.org/about).

## **Modes of Censorship in the World's Five Most Censored Countries**

**By Laura Cardona**

In recent years, there has been a renewed global interest in freedom of the press and free expression following incidents of violence against journalists that have received global attention. Some of the most notable incidents include the murders of journalists James Foley and Kenji Goto, and the attack on Charlie Hebdo in Paris. Though the public appears to be more aware of these issues, whether the outpouring of support will continue and the impact these issues will have on press freedom is unclear. However, it is clear that the growing threats to media freedom pose a threat to democratic values around the world. Unrestricted access to information is a central pillar of a free society and gives individuals the chance to evaluate information for themselves in order draw their own conclusions. This enables citizens to take actions such as advocating for social change and political reform or demanding accountability of their governments (Freedom House, 2015).

As part of the Committee to Protect Journalists' (CPJ) annual publication, "Attacks on the Press", the organization compiled a list of the 10 most censored countries in the world. The CPJ determined that the top five most censored countries are Eritrea, North Korea, Saudi Arabia, Ethiopia, and Azerbaijan. Journalists and other members of the media in these countries are censored by means of imprisonment, legal repression, internet restriction and are limited to government-run agencies that determine the content that is published or broadcast (Committee to Protect Journalists, 2015).

Under the leadership of President Isaias Afewerki, who has held this position since the country's independence in 1993, Eritrea was determined the most censored country in the world as per the CPJ. With the most jailed journalists in Africa, even those who work for heavily censored state news outlets live in constant fear of arrest for reports that may be misconstrued as

critical of the government or leaked information. Only state-run media is allowed in the country, and the last privately owned outlets were suspended in 2001. Journalists forced into exile are often the providers of the only independent online news websites and broadcasts, which have little reach. EriTel, the only state-run telecommunications company, holds strict control of the Internet and broadcast signals, and less than 1 percent of the population goes online (Committee to Protect Journalists, 2015).

A relatively young country, Eritrea became independent from Ethiopia on May 24, 1993. Much of the issues revolving media censorship in the country can be traced back to the development of its government when it first achieved independence. From its beginnings, the government lacked the foundation to give its people an efficient independent legislature, a judiciary and the fourth estate. This lack of foundation deprived citizens of the right to information (Murthy, 2013, p.173). Lack of parliamentary elections may have marked the beginning of a clash between the print media and the government. The president of Eritrea did not uphold the Constitution of 1997 in which it was determined that parliamentary elections would be held, something the media was very critical of. As a result, the president had the journalists who reported on the matter arrested and the ordered the closure of the press (Murthy, 2013, p.178).

Though the Eritrean Constitution assured freedom of expression and freedom of the press, independent outlets have been banned since September 2001. According to a report from Reporters without Borders, the country holds the world's highest number of journalists that have been imprisoned without the location of their whereabouts being known. These journalists have also never been formally charged in a court of law. Governmental officials often justify such arrests by telling the public journalists have acted as spies and threaten national interests and

security (Murthy, 2013, pp. 180-181). Eritrea remains at the bottom of the freedom rankings in part because of the threat of imprisonment to journalists. In 2010, at least 30 journalists and four media contributors were held without contact to the outside world and without being informed about their situation or a right to trial (Frère, 2014, p.184).

Named the second most censored country by the CPJ, North Korea faces a similar situation to Eritrea in that access to independent news is extremely limited. Though Article 53 of the constitution calls for freedom of the press, nearly all the content of the country's publications and broadcasts come from the state-run Korean Central News Agency (KCNA), focusing on political leadership. This includes the Associated Press bureau, which is located in the Korean Central News Agency's Pyongyang headquarters. Internet access is primarily restricted to the political elite, and schools and state institutions have tightly controlled online access. Citizens receive their independent information and news from smuggled DVDs, bootlegged TV and radio signals from China, and smuggled phones that depend on Chinese cell towers (Committee to Protect Journalists, 2015).

Nevertheless, though the media is heavily controlled, the government has made sure it remains an active part of the public's lives. The regime uses the KCNA for propaganda and controlled distribution of information that paints the government in a favorable light. The KCNA publishes articles and has increased its Internet presence in recent years. This is all in the effort of sending the message that North Korean leader Kim Jong Un is beloved by his people, and that North Korea is strong and prepared to fight wars against imperialist enemies. In this way, the KCNA has used the Internet and social media as a platform for domestic and foreign policies (Altenberger, 2014, 632-633).

In the third most censored country according to the CPJ, Saudi Arabia, the media has faced challenges with intensified legal repression, particularly since the Arab Spring. In 2011, amendments to press law punished those involved in publications that conflicted with Sharia, impinged on state interests, promoted foreign interests, harmed public order or national security, or enabled criminal activity. Moreover, the General Commission for Audiovisual Media said in 2014 that it would monitor online content, particularly from YouTube to make sure Saudi contributors adhere to government guidelines. A large population of Saudi citizens used YouTube to address controversial issues and document events not covered by the media. Restrictions were also passed to prevent media in member states of the Gulf Cooperation Council from criticizing other member states' governments (Committee to Protect Journalists, 2015).

A journalist who criticizes any of the member states risks losing his or her job and having his or her publication shut down. The Arab press has been controlled by Gulf oil money, and Saudi Arabia has exerted its influence in ensuring that member states do not offend it. The Arab press abides by the unofficial rule that any editor who offends Saudi Arabia in any way faces losing lucrative Gulf sales and drawing attention to his or her own country (El-Affendi, 1993, p. 180). Saudi officials have also allowed advertising on television stations aimed at the Gulf from London and Egypt that air in Riyadh, the Saudi capital. Saudi Arabia and other countries have also been able to exert their influence on major Arabic-language publications abroad by buying them out or corrupting them (p. 175).

Press freedom in Ethiopia, the fourth most censored country, has been threatened by arrests, intimidation and state-controlled broadcast and Internet access. Ethiopia has done away with most of the country's independent publications, and with a population of more than 90 million, there are no independent broadcasters and only a handful of independent publications.



State-run telecommunications company Ethio Telecom is the only Internet provider, which often suspends news websites. However, citizens sometimes intermittently receive broadcasts from the U.S.-based opposition Ethiopian Satellite Television. Though there are foreign journalists in the country, many are under the constant eye of the government and face harassment. In 2014, 16 journalists fled into exile, ten independent journalists and bloggers were arrested on anti-state charges, and at least eight independent publications were shut down after the government filed a lawsuit accusing several publications of encouraging terrorist activities (Committee to Protect Journalists, 2015).

Freedom of the press in Ethiopia has also been violated by means of legal repression. Though the Ethiopian Constitution grants freedom of the press, Article 10 of the 1992 Press Proclamation has been used as a way to prosecute journalists and restrict the media. Article 10 states that the press must ensure content cannot give rise to criminal or civil liability, contain defamatory accusations against nationalities, people or organizations, or incite conflict. The Ethiopian government has often cited this proclamation to limit press freedom and prosecute journalists (Ross, 2010, pp. 1050-1051).

The 2005 elections were a negative turning point for development in Ethiopia. Though opposition parties participated in televised debates and campaigned, a thirty-day ban was placed on any and all rallies. Protestors gathered when opposing parties each declared victory, accusing the National Electoral Board of Ethiopia of manipulating the results. Shortly after, police were ordered to arrest protesters, rally leaders, human rights investigators, and local election observers. The government also revoked journalists' accreditation in order to stop any attention by the foreign press. Slowly the government turned to the independent press in Ethiopia, and under the 1992 Press Proclamation journalists could face criminal charges for several offenses.

Journalists were accused of violating the Press Proclamation, and court cases often spanned years. A few months later in November 2005, the government began a “crackdown” on the private media. State-run media took over, carrying propaganda that tarnished private and foreign media as the government continued to prosecute and threaten journalists. Several newspapers were closed down and many members of the media fled the country. Those who did not leave were forced to work under self-censorship (Ross, 2010, pp. 1051-1053).

It is important to note that though Eritrea and Ethiopia place in the top five most corrupt countries in the world, according to the CPJ, Africa as a whole is not the worst continent when it comes to journalists’ security. As per the Reporters Without Borders recent global indicator of worldwide media freedom, Sub-Saharan Africa is ranked ahead of Asia-Pacific, former Soviet states, the Middle East and several North African countries. The indicator also shows that being a journalist in Africa was still less dangerous than practicing journalism in countries like Mexico, Pakistan and Syria, even though seven of the 25 countries in which journalists were killed in 2010 were in Africa (Frère, 2014, p.182).

Like most of the previously mentioned countries, the press in Azerbaijan is subject to state control, imprisonment, intimidation and legal repression. As the fifth most censored country, citizens in Azerbaijan receive most of their information from state-controlled broadcasters. The country’s main print publications face harassment from the state, such as lawsuits evictions and advisories against advertising, a criminal defamation law has caused online speech to be self-censored, and news and social media websites are arbitrarily blocked. In 2014, several journalists fled the country and those who did not faced harassment, and at least 10 journalists and bloggers are currently in jail. Several international non-governmental organizations supporting local media, including the Institute for Reporters’ Freedom and Safety,

were forced out of Azerbaijan after officials raided their offices, froze bank accounts and accused them of crimes (Committee to Protect Journalists, 2015).

The work of a journalist trying to expose corruption in general is typically difficult and dangerous, more so in the case of countries like Azerbaijan. Reporters Without Borders regularly reports the murder, assault and imprisonment of journalists who attempt to expose political corruption. Investigative reporter Khadija Ismayilova is one of the 10 jailed journalists, and is currently awaiting trial with small likelihood of a fair hearing. The Aliyev regime (the first family of Azerbaijan) has suppressed accounts of its interest in the country's telecommunications and continues to persecute Ismayilova (Sutherland, 2015, p. 38).

Similar to North Korea, the government of Azerbaijan has used the Internet and social media to promote its own political agenda. A study and analysis of Azerbaijani media published in the *Journal of Communication* shows the government has successfully dissuaded Internet users from engaging in protests and using social media for political purposes. Though the study concludes that these efforts by the government may not have changed public opinion about the regime, it has dissuaded individuals from engaging in political activity, particularly online. Findings showed that the government's campaign against online activism was effective because frequent Internet users were significantly less supportive of anti-governmental protests. The Azerbaijani government has also tried to deter citizens from using social media, and while these efforts may not have been entirely successful, it was able to change how frequent Internet users feel about disagreeing with the government (Pearce and Kendzior, 2012, pp. 283 – 284).

In addition to the aforementioned factors, press freedom is also threatened by corruption within the media. This may take the form of bribery, staged or fake news, agenda-driven advertisements, gift giving or receiving, and intentional bias. Providing technical training to

journalists and supporting investigative journalism is one of many ways to fight corruption within the media. Other approaches include raising awareness of attacks on press freedom, advocating for governments to implement media policies and legislation to enforce strict transparency rules, and raising professional standards for journalists. These efforts would require cooperation from international journalism organizations, news media owners and managers, and public relations professionals to raise awareness of issues like media censorship and media corruption, as well as promoting ethics training, creating media accountability systems and documenting instances in which journalists have received or extorted payment for news (Transparency International, 2013.)

In conclusion, media censorship and attacks on the press pose a threat to democratic freedom in developing countries. As exemplified by the five most censored countries in the world as per the CPJ's publication, "Attacks on the Press", journalists and members of the media are subject to imprisonment, legal repression, internet restriction and are limited to government-run agencies that determine the stories they can cover. The media itself can also fall to corruption. There are several approaches to tackling these issues, which require cooperation from international organizations, heads of media outlets and news consumers.

## Bibliography

- Altenberger, Lisa-Maria. "Likes for the Leader: North Korea's Use of the Internet and Social Media." *Asian Politics & Policy* 6.4 (2014): 631-34.
- El-Affendi, Abdelwahb. "Eclipse of Reason: The Media in the Muslim World." *Journal of International Affairs* 47.1 (1993): 163-93.
- "Freedom of the Press 2015." *Freedom House*. 2015. Web.
- Frère, Marie-Soleil. "Journalist in Africa: A High-risk Profession under Threat." *Journal of African Media Studies* 6.2 (2014): 181-98.
- Mendes, Mara. "Corruption in Developing Countries." *Transparency International*. 27 Feb. 2013. Web.
- Murthy, C. S. H. N. "State-Owned Media And Democratization In Eritrea: An Analytical Study." *Global Media Journal African Edition* 6.2 (2013): 172-215.
- Pearce, Katy E., and Sarah Kendzior. "Networked Authoritarianism and Social Media in Azerbaijan." *Journal of Communication* 62.2 (2012): 283-98.
- Ross, Tracy J. "A Test of Democracy: Ethiopia's Mass Media and Freedom of Information Proclamation." *Penn State Law Review* 114.3 (2010): 1047-1066.
- Sutherland, Ewan. "Bribery and Corruption in Telecommunications – The Republic of Azerbaijan." *Info* 17.5 (2015): 20-45.
- "10 Most Censored Countries." *Committee to Protect Journalists*. 2015. Web.

# Using Economic Sanctions to Enforce Human Rights: The United States and South Africa

By Carrie Hartnett

## I. Introduction

Before the twentieth century, the treatment of individuals within a state was considered a domestic affair to be dealt with based on the internal norms and laws of that state.<sup>1</sup> For many centuries there was no international human rights regime at all, and the international community often participated in and even supported human rights atrocities. Several large international events eventually led to the establishment of human rights norms and with this creation of standards came various ways to “enforce” these norms, like economic sanctions.<sup>2</sup> Economic sanctions were historically used during times of military conflict or trade embargoes, but in the late twentieth century they became a tool used to spur change where international norms were being violated by state or non-state actors.<sup>3</sup> Economic sanctions also began to be imposed if a state felt its actions or interests were being directly threatened by another state.<sup>4</sup> In comparison to the rest of the world, the United States uses more economic sanctions than any other country and the success of these sanctions is widely debated. One debate in particular centers around the United States and the economic sanctions it imposed against South Africa in response to apartheid. It leads to the question, “Were the economic sanctions the United States imposed on South Africa effective means of protecting and promoting fundamental human rights?” To answer this question, it is necessary to understand the development of international human rights,

---

<sup>1</sup> Linda A. Malone, *Black Letter Outline on International Human Rights* (St. Paul: Thomson Reuters, 2012), 21.

<sup>2</sup> *Ibid.*, 21.

<sup>3</sup> Jonathan Masters, “What Are Economic Sanctions?” Council on Foreign Relations, last modified April 8, 2015, <http://www.cfr.org/sanctions/economic-sanctions/p36259>.

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.*

the situation in South Africa and how the United States attempted to solve it, and to examine counter arguments. This question is an important area of study because if these sanctions were in fact successful, could they not be used successful in all states that violate international human rights laws? Or were the political and social conditions in South Africa combined with other outside influences simply the perfect circumstances to facilitate major change? While often initially hurting the poorest civilians, the economic sanctions imposed upon South Africa by the United States were successful in motivating the country to update their human rights norms and setting an example of using economic sanctions to enforce international law.

## **II. Development of International Human Rights**

To understand the grounds on which the United States was permitted to impose economic sanctions, it is important to briefly describe the internationalization of individual rights and methods of enforcing them. The abolishment of slavery in several major countries is often cited as the starting point to the internationalization of individual rights and agreed upon norms.<sup>5</sup> Public pressure in response to slavery was increasing so greatly, that states were forced to come together on this issue. Many European states came together at the Congress of Vienna in 1814-1815 and there it was acknowledged that the international slave trade was “repugnant to the principles of humanity and universal morality.”<sup>6</sup> In 1833 Britain emancipated their slaves, France followed in 1848, and almost all Latin American countries emancipated their slaves as soon as their countries’ independence was achieved.<sup>7</sup> Slavery slowly became unacceptable on a global scale. The abolishment of slavery became an internationally agreed upon norm and

---

<sup>5</sup> Viljoen, Frans. “International Human Rights Law: A Short History.” *The Magazine of the United Nations*, 46, no. 1 & 2(2009).

<sup>6</sup> Dinah L. Shelton, “An Introduction to the History of International Human Rights Law,” George Washington Law School, last modified 2007,

[http://scholarship.law.gwu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2045&context=faculty\\_publications](http://scholarship.law.gwu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2045&context=faculty_publications).

<sup>7</sup> *Ibid.*, 6.

governments were prepared to act on an international scale if this basic human right of freedom was violated.

The twentieth century saw great strides in the establishment of international basic human rights and also the enforcement of these rights. The industrial revolution led to an increase in factories and also an increase in exploitation of workers. Pressure began to mount for reform and finally after World War I an international organization was founded to address these exploitations called the International Association for the Protection of Labor.<sup>8</sup> This association was founded on human rights doctrines and all members agreed to support enforcement of any association agreements.<sup>9</sup> The next major step in establishing an international human rights system was the League of Nations in 1920.<sup>10</sup> While ultimately failing, this organization was the first whose goal was simply to maintain world peace and also a major step in leading to the creation of the United Nations. Finally, as a result of World War II, the United Nations was created to prevent another world war from ever happening again. A main goal of this organization is the promotion of human rights which happens through the UN Charter and a network of treaties adopted by UN members.<sup>11</sup> The charter system applies to all UN member states, while only states who have ratified treaties are required to abide by them.<sup>12</sup>

---

<sup>8</sup> Dinah L. Shelton, "An Introduction to the History of International Human Rights Law," George Washington Law School, last modified 2007, [http://scholarship.law.gwu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2045&context=faculty\\_publications](http://scholarship.law.gwu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2045&context=faculty_publications).

<sup>9</sup> Ibid.

<sup>10</sup> Ibid.

<sup>11</sup> Viljoen, Frans. "International Human Rights Law: A Short History." *The Magazine of the United Nations*, 46, no. 1 & 2(2009).

<sup>12</sup> Ibid.



Article twenty-four of the UN Charter gives the responsibility of maintaining world peace and security to the UN Security Council.<sup>13</sup> The form of “punishment” given by this council often comes in the form of sanctions. In fact, the second country to ever have sanctions imposed upon them by the UN Security Council was South Africa in response to their apartheid regime, bringing us full circle to racially motivated human rights issues.<sup>14</sup> While sanctions are fraught with issues, due to the fact that they often affect the people that need protecting, when UN sanctions are backed up with additional sanctions from larger countries like the US, they have a much higher rate of success.<sup>15</sup> Looking at economic sanctions specifically, this became a vital tool to force countries to a place where they have to address their human rights violations. In the case of South Africa, we see a clearly laid out example of economic sanctions really forcing South Africa to update their human rights norms and setting a worldwide example about the use of economic sanctions. Earlier in the 20<sup>th</sup> century this kind of state intervention would not have been permitted, but as human rights violations became a larger international concern, multilateral and unilateral intervention became acceptable.<sup>16</sup>

---

<sup>13</sup> Linda A. Malone, *Black Letter Outline on International Human Rights* (St. Paul: Thomson Reuters, 2012), 118.

<sup>14</sup> George A. Lopez, “Enforcing Human Rights Through Economic Sanctions,” in *The Oxford Handbook of International Human Rights Law*, ed. Dinah Shelton (Oxford: OUP Oxford, 2013), 777.

<sup>15</sup> George A. Lopez, “Enforcing Human Rights Through Economic Sanctions,” in *The Oxford Handbook of International Human Rights Law*, ed. Dinah Shelton (Oxford: OUP Oxford, 2013), 777.

<sup>16</sup> Buham Suk Baek, “Economic Sanctions Against Human Rights Violations,” Cornell Law Library, last modified 2008, [http://scholarship.law.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1039&context=lps\\_clap](http://scholarship.law.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1039&context=lps_clap).

### III. South Africa, The United States, and Economic Sanctions

Apartheid was a system of segregation based on race that started to be enforced in South Africa in 1948, when it was officially written into their legislation.<sup>17</sup> By the mid 1980's, many international organizations and powerful nations had implemented economic, military, or cultural sanctions against South Africa in response to apartheid.<sup>18</sup> It had long been established that racial segregation was a fundamental human rights violation and South Africa needed to adjust their way of life. In the beginning of the 1980's, the United States knew they had to do something, but there was disagreement between the Reagan administration and Congress on what exactly to do.<sup>19</sup> The Reagan administration supported the policy of "constructive engagement" (maintaining a relationship), while Congress thought imposing economic sanctions was the best way to go.<sup>20</sup>

In June of 1985 a state of emergency was declared in South Africa and it was time for the United States to act. President Reagan still wanted to pursue constructive engagement and so he deterred congressional action by imposing limited sanctions through an executive order.<sup>21</sup> These sanctions included a ban on the import of gold Krugerrands, a ban on technology exports, and taking steps to get United States' companies doing business in South Africa to integrate their workforces there.<sup>22</sup> As the situation in South Africa continued to worsen, Congress decided to

---

<sup>17</sup> Audie Klotz, "Norms Reconstituting Interests: Global Racial Equality and U.S. Sanctions Against South Africa," *International Organization* 49, no. 3 (1995): 451.

<sup>18</sup> *Ibid.*, 451.

<sup>19</sup> Kenneth A. Rodman, "Public and Private Sanctions against South Africa," *Political Science Quarterly* 109, no. 2 (1994): 322.

<sup>20</sup> Kenneth A. Rodman, "Public and Private Sanctions against South Africa," *Political Science Quarterly* 109, no. 2 (1994): 322.

<sup>21</sup> *Ibid.*, 322.

<sup>22</sup> *Ibid.*, 322.

override a presidential veto and implement economic sanctions.<sup>23</sup> In 1986, Congress passed the Comprehensive Anti-Apartheid Act.<sup>24</sup> The main features of the CAAA were restricted lending to South Africa, import bans on iron, steel, coal, uranium, textiles, and agricultural goods, and export bans on crude oils, refined petroleum technology, and computer sales.<sup>25</sup> Congress successfully overrode constructive engagement and began to attempt to force South Africa to change their ways through restrictive economic sanctions.

Along with economic sanctions, conditions for termination of the sanctions were attached to the bill as well. These conditions included: release of all political prisoners and Nelson Mandela, repeal of the state of emergency, reinstatement of democratic parties and allow all South Africans to form political parties, express political opinions, and participate in the political process, repeal of the Group Areas Act and the Population Registration Act, and also agree to enter into good faith negotiations with members of the black majority.<sup>26</sup> The economic sanctions on South Africa lasted until the year 1990 when Nelson Mandela was released from prison, the South African government amended the apartheid laws, and black South Africans were given political rights.<sup>27</sup> It is estimated that from the time the United States imposed the economic sanctions to the time that they were lifted, South Africa lost about \$354 million annually.<sup>28</sup> From the United States' sanctions alone, it is said to have caused the loss of more than 100,000 jobs in

---

<sup>23</sup> Aryeh Neier, "Sanctions and Human Rights," *Social Research* 82.4 (2015):3.

<sup>24</sup> Kenneth A. Rodman, "Public and Private Sanctions against South Africa," *Political Science Quarterly* 109, no. 2 (1994): 322.

<sup>25</sup> Philip I. Levy, "Sanctions on South Africa: What Did They Do?" *The American Economic Review* 89, no. 2 (1999): 417.

<sup>26</sup> Buhm Suk Baek, "Economic Sanctions Against Human Rights Violations," Cornell Law Library, last modified 2008, [http://scholarship.law.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1039&context=lps\\_clacp](http://scholarship.law.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1039&context=lps_clacp).

<sup>27</sup> Ibid.

<sup>28</sup> Philip I. Levy, "Sanctions on South Africa: What Did They Do?" *The American Economic Review* 89, no. 2 (1999): 418.

South Africa.<sup>29</sup> Economic sanctions have a long and brutal history of often hurting the people who need the most help, but in cases like South Africa the sanctions were held in place in the hopes that the government would bow to the pressure.

Can we judge from this short history whether these sanctions were successful in motivating South Africa to update their human rights norms? Is this a success story for using economic sanctions to promote change? Judging by numbers alone, the economic impact of the sanctions the United States imposed was not exceptionally heavy. However, there were often statements from South Africans who drew a connection between political change and the economic climate.<sup>30</sup> Nelson Mandela was quoted as saying, “To lift sanctions now would be to run the risk of aborting the process toward ending apartheid.”<sup>31</sup> Black South Africans were often the racial group most affected by economic sanctions and yet they believed in the power of economic sanctions and believed that they were helping South Africa change. Maybe the sanctions imposed by the United States did not leave a huge dent in the economy, but it did have an effect.

While economic sanctions are meant to target a state economically, these sanctions coming from a powerhouse nation like the United States would also have had profound psychological effects on the government and people of South Africa. These sanctions would have meant a disconnect from the United States and isolation from the international community as a whole. The United States is considered by most to be an important ally and separation from them due to economic sanctions would not have been taken lightly. With the Cold War ending,

---

<sup>29</sup> Buhm Suk Baek, “Economic Sanctions Against Human Rights Violations,” Cornell Law Library, last modified 2008, [http://scholarship.law.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1039&context=lps\\_clacp](http://scholarship.law.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1039&context=lps_clacp).

<sup>30</sup> Philip I. Levy, “Sanctions on South Africa: What Did They Do?” *The American Economic Review* 89, no. 2 (1999): 419.

<sup>31</sup> *Ibid.*, 419.

the United States had less of a reason to ally with South Africa and South Africa could quite possibly have ended up alone on a dangerous continent.<sup>32</sup> These sanctions also would have announced to the rest of the world that the United States did not approve of what was going on in South Africa and been an example to other potential states where human rights violations were occurring of what could happen to them.

#### **IV. Counterarguments**

There are scholars who judge these specific economic sanctions to be effective and scholars who disagree. However, even the scholars who deem these sanctions “ineffective” cannot say that they had no contribution at all to the eradication of apartheid. It is without a doubt that the impact of these sanctions were heightened by many other contributing factors. South African passports were not accepted in many countries and their athletes were banned from participating in international competitions, all messages to South Africa and its government that the world did not approve of their current regime.<sup>33</sup>

In “Sanctions on South Africa: What Did They Do?” Philip Levy identifies three factors specifically that he believes tell a story of the “ineffectiveness” of sanctions.<sup>34</sup> He points out the reform that the employment industry underwent in the 1970’s, allowing black South Africans to work at skilled jobs in white areas as representing a relaxation in the apartheid regime.<sup>35</sup> This reform, while giving black South Africans more opportunities, was also technically still serving the interests of the white population and may not have had that large of an impact on the fall of apartheid. Secondly, Levy identifies the anti-apartheid political movement that took place inside

---

<sup>32</sup> Aryeh Neier, “Sanctions and Human Rights,” *Social Research* 82.4 (2015):3.

<sup>33</sup> *Ibid.*, 3.

<sup>34</sup> Philip I. Levy, “Sanctions on South Africa: What Did They Do?” *The American Economic Review* 89, no. 2 (1999): 419.

<sup>35</sup> *Ibid.*, 416.

South Africa that caused instability, making South Africa unattractive to foreign investors.<sup>36</sup>

While this factor cannot be taken lightly, this movement was not enough to spur change. Without the economic sanctions, the lack of foreign investment may not have been enough to overthrow the apartheid regime or may have taken much, much longer. The third and final main point that Levy makes is that the fall of communism in combination with these other two factors would have led to reform.<sup>37</sup> Levy states that the South African government was consistently afraid of being taken into the communist bloc and with this fear removed, they might have relaxed their policies.<sup>38</sup> However, it can also be argued that the fall of communism was a reason the economic sanctions actually worked. Without the concern for the spread of communism, the United States did not have to try and maintain a relationship with South Africa and the economic sanctions would have represented the first step towards the isolation of their country.

The failed cases of using economic sanctions to promote human rights in Cuba and China are often used to prove that economic sanctions are ineffective. However, the cases in Myanmar, Poland, and Iran, where many believe economic sanctions were successful, can be used to prove that economic sanctions are effective. In the case of China, the reason for failure is very obvious. While as a nation we do not condone or support human rights violations, it is sometimes impossible to use economic sanctions against a country like China because it might end up being more costly for the United States than China. There is almost no counterargument in the case of South Africa and the United States where it is able to be said that the economic sanctions had absolutely no effect at all. There are many arguments that say it was not

---

<sup>36</sup> Ibid., 419.

<sup>37</sup> Ibid., 419.

<sup>38</sup> Ibid., 419.

successful on its own, but that still does not say that it was not a successful contribution to the end of apartheid.

## **V. Conclusion**

It is not possible to make the argument that economic sanctions against South Africa completely failed in accomplishing their goals. It is quite possible to argue that other factors were also relevant, but does this still not mean that economic sanctions were successful? Every condition that the United States laid out for the termination of the sanctions was met in South Africa. South Africa was not obliged to meet all these requirements for every state or non-state, yet they still met them, lifting the sanctions. While it cannot be said that the United States led the way in forcing change in South Africa, they eventually got involved and made an impact. Due to the internationalization of human rights and organizations like the United Nations, the problem in South Africa was recognized globally as a problem that needed to be solved. Without these organizations and universally accepted human rights norms, the problem may not have received the same solutions or even be recognized as a problem. The apartheid regime in South Africa was wrong and the United States came to see that and eventually came to the realization that economic sanctions were needed. While successful in South Africa, economic sanctions should not be a “blanket” solution as each country is different and there are many, many other external and internal factors to consider. These sanctions did have some negative effects on the country and the people, but they were successful in forcing South Africa to update their human rights norms and setting an example.

## Bibliography

- Baek, Buhm Suk. "Economic Sanctions Against Human Rights Violations." Cornell Law Library. Last modified 2008.  
[http://scholarship.law.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1039&context=lps\\_clacp](http://scholarship.law.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1039&context=lps_clacp)
- Rodman, Kenneth A. "Public and Private Sanctions against South Africa." *Political Science Quarterly* 109, no. 2 (1994): 313-334.
- Klotz, Audie. "Norms Reconstituting Interests: Global Racial Equality and U.S. Sanctions Against South Africa." *International Organization* 49, no. 3 (1995): 451-478.
- Levy, Philip I. "Sanctions on South Africa: What Did They Do?" *The American Economic Review* 89.2, no. 2 (1999): 415-420.
- Lopez, George A. "Enforcing Human Rights Through Economic Sanctions." In *The Oxford Handbook of International Human Rights Law*, edited by Dinah Shelton, 772-793. Oxford: OUP Oxford, 2013.
- Malone, Linda A. *Black Letter Outline on International Human Rights*. St. Paul: Thomson Reuters, 2012.
- Masters, Jonathan. "What Are Economic Sanctions?" Council on Foreign Relations. Last modified April 8, 2015. <http://www.cfr.org/sanctions/economic-sanctions/p36259>.
- Neier, Aryeh. "Sanctions and Human Rights." *Social Research* 82.4 (2015) 1-7.
- Shelton, Dinah L. "An Introduction to the History of International Human Rights Law." George Washington Law School. Last modified 2007.  
[http://scholarship.law.gwu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2045&context=faculty\\_publications](http://scholarship.law.gwu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2045&context=faculty_publications).
- Viljoen, Frans. "International Human Rights Law: A Short History." *The Magazine of the United Nations*, 46, no. 1 & 2(200



## **An Examination of the Infant Mortality Rate in Honduras**

**By Gregory King**

The infant mortality rate is often used to measure the health of a population as well as the quality of health care available to that population. It can also be used as an indicator of poverty (Association of Maternal and Child Health Programs, November 2016). The infant mortality rate is defined as the number of infant deaths per live births. It can be narrowed down to specific geographic regions in order to measure development. In Honduras, the infant mortality rate is relatively high, despite having reduced it by over 50% in the past 20 years; it is still 17.7 per 1,000 infants born (CIA World Factbook, November 2016). This can be compared with Iceland (one of the world leaders in low infant mortality), which has an infant mortality rate of 2.1 per 1,000 infants born (CIA World Factbook, November 2016). This rate places Honduras in the bottom 50% of countries both globally and in Central and South America (CIA World Factbook, November 2016). While it is difficult to pinpoint the exact cause of infant mortality in a given country such as Honduras, there are general factors that are known to contribute to high infant mortality rates. These contributors include poor maternal education, poor access to or a lack of use of family planning and contraception, poverty and wealth and income inequality, and poor access to health care.

It is well established in the field of public health that maternal education leads to a decrease in infant mortality for a multitude of reasons. When a mother has received more education, she is less likely to accept traditional explanations for illness, such as “empacho,” which is a digestive condition thought to be caused by eating foods at improper times or “mal de ojo,” which is an affliction thought to be caused by a curse from a hostile glare. Mothers are also less likely to accept traditional cures for illness, such as medical leeches or treatments given by

witch doctors and psychics, and thus will seek adequate medical treatment. (Caldwell and McDonald, 1982, pg. 252). Additionally, when the mother is educated, women and children in the family are given higher priority with regards to care and resources than when maternal education is absent. This is especially true when it comes to food distribution. Women and children receive a greater share of food, especially meat, when the mother is more educated (Caldwell and McDonald, 1982, pg. 266). This is crucial because women need, on average, 35% more protein (71 grams versus 46 grams) than normal during pregnancy (Mayo Clinic, November 2016) and when breastfeeding (Livestrong, November 2016). Increased protein and caloric intake are crucial during pregnancy because a deficiency can cause complications during birth. It is also important during breastfeeding, which “reduces infant mortality due to common childhood illnesses such as diarrhoea [*sic*] or pneumonia, and helps for a quicker recovery during illness.” This is due to multiple reasons. One of the most important being that the mother passes her antibodies to the infant via her breastmilk. An infant’s immune system is not fully developed when they are first born and only gradually develops during the infant’s first year of life (Zola, 1997, pg. 589); this is therefore an important factor in increasing an infant’s chances of survival. Breast milk also provides enhanced nutrition over alternative methods of infant feeding and also serves as a safer source of liquids than the potentially unclean water in Honduras (Daniel King (Physician) in discussion with the author, November 2016). These are all factors that assist in the reduction of the infant mortality rate. Furthermore, according to the Scientific American, “Women with more education tend to have smaller families, in part because of increased employment opportunities and better knowledge about contraception; fewer children in a family improves the chances that an infant will survive. More education also helps women make better

decisions about many health and disease factors such as prenatal care, basic hygiene, nutrition and immunization...”

Increased prenatal care decreases the risk that the infant will have a low birth weight, which is the leading cause of death in the early stages of infancy (Maternal and Child Health Bureau, November 2016). Low birth weight babies can suffer from low oxygen levels at birth, difficulty feeding and gaining weight, the inability to maintain body temperature, and sudden infant death syndrome. (Stanford Children’s Health, November 2016). Furthermore, as mentioned in the Scientific American, an increase in maternal education is correlated with an increase in basic hygiene and immunizations, which lower the risk of disease for infants, a cause of mortality during infancy. The lack of maternal education in Honduras is painfully clear when enrollment and attendance rates are compared with more developed countries. In 2012, Iceland had a female pre-primary education gross enrollment ratio of 95.5% (UNICEF, November 2016) compared to Honduras’ ratio of 44.6% (UNICEF, November 2016). The secondary education net female enrollment ratio in Iceland in 2012 was 89.1% (UNICEF, November 2016), whereas the Honduras secondary education net female attendance ratio was 52.4% (UNICEF, November 2016). Given these statistics, it becomes clear that a lack of maternal education in Honduras is one of the factors that causes its relatively high infant mortality rate.

In addition to maternal education, access to and use of contraception and family planning decreases the infant mortality rate because they allow for an increase in time between pregnancies and a decrease in the adolescent pregnancy rate. The risk of low birth weight and preterm births increases when pregnancies occur closer together. It is posited that this occurs because the mother does not have sufficient time to recover from the physical stress of the first pregnancy, however behavioral risk factors that are the root of closely spaced pregnancies may

also explain the increased risks of those pregnancies (Mayo Clinic, November 2016).

Furthermore, when conception occurs within six months of the previous birth, the risk for low birth weight and prematurity doubles (Cleland *et al*, 2012, pg. 149). Contraception and family planning, in this situation, can be used to increase the duration between pregnancies and thus improve perinatal<sup>1</sup> outcomes and child survival. (Cleland *et al*, 2012, pg. 149). In addition to short duration between pregnancies, adolescent pregnancies also have higher rates of infant mortality. Stillborn infants and infant deaths in the first seven days of life are 50% more common in pregnancies where the mother is under twenty years of age versus mothers that are between twenty and twenty-nine years old. Mortality during the first month of life increases by 50-100% when the mother is adolescent versus if the mother is older, and mortality increases as the age of the mother decreases (World Health Organization, November 2016). Adolescent pregnancies are also at risk of producing preterm infants and infants with low birth weight due to poor eating habits and poor health seeking behavior in young women (Health Communities, November 2016). Adolescent pregnancies are a significant problem in Honduras. In 2010, the adolescent birth rate in Honduras was 107.9 (UNICEF, November 2016), which is astoundingly high when compared with Iceland's adolescent birth rate of 10.6 in the same year (UNICEF, November 2016). Preterm, or premature, infants are more susceptible to respiratory distress syndrome, which can cause partial lung collapse; intraventricular hemorrhage (brain bleeds); necrotizing enterocolitis, in which portions of the intestines die; and infections. These afflictions all contribute to infant mortality (March of Dimes, November 2016). Access to and use of contraception, however, decreases the adolescent fertility rate and thus decreases the risk of

---

<sup>1</sup> The World Health Organization defines the perinatal period as beginning at 22 weeks of gestation and ending seven days after birth, however definitions vary, and according to some definitions, the perinatal period can end as late as four weeks after pregnancy

premature and low birth weight births. Unfortunately, Honduras has insufficient family planning resources and access to and use of contraception is low. This is especially true for rural areas, where access to both family planning and contraception resources is abysmal and there remains a high need for family planning resources despite recent progress (Toruño, pg. 327). Additionally, the powerful influence of the Catholic Church in Honduran politics and society inhibits the proliferation of contraception and the expansion of family planning. The Church forbids the use of contraception. Catholic Church officials stated that individuals who promoted the use of or used emergency contraception would be excommunicated. This hardline stance on contraception by the Catholic Church only serves to hamper the reduction of the infant mortality rate (García *et al*, 2006, pg. 188). Not only does the Catholic Church, which has a powerful influence as a social institution in Latin America, hold a negative stance on contraception and family planning, so too does the government. In 2012, the Honduran Supreme Court upheld an absolute ban on emergency contraceptives, which was passed by the Honduran Congress in 2009. Honduras' youth face many obstacles to obtaining contraception. Roughly 50% of sexually active young women in Honduras and three other Latin American countries reported experiencing difficulty obtaining contraception. This statistic is even higher for single women and adolescent women (Center for Reproductive Rights, November 2016). As a result, Honduras has one of the highest adolescent fertility rates in Latin America (Toruño, pg. 325). Until contraception and family planning can be made more available to the people of Honduras, low birth weight pregnancies as a result of adolescent and rapid, multiple pregnancies will persist, and the infant mortality rate will remain high.

Economic factors also affect the infant mortality rate in Honduras with the gap between the rich and the poor and the high level of poverty in the country being the main contributors.

Honduras has one of the most unequal distributions of income in Latin America (Johnson and Lefebvre, 2013, pg. 1). In 2012, Honduras' Gini index was 50.64 (World Bank, November 2016), and the poverty rate was 17.9% (UNICEF, November 2016). This is in sharp contrast with Iceland where the Gini Index in 2012 was 26.94 (World Bank, November 2016), and the poverty rate was 4.6% (UNICEF, November 2016). Both Iceland's Gini index and poverty rate are half that of Honduras'. This signifies that poverty and economic inequality are major contributors to the infant mortality rate in Honduras because poverty and economic inequality can be devastating to an infants' chances for life. One reason for this significant impact is that the economically disadvantaged have severely limited options when seeking necessary health services. Access to health care and the quality of health care received by an individual is directly related to the economic status of that individual (Country Studies, November 2016).

Furthermore, poverty increases an infant's chances of death by 50% (Gortmaker, 1979, pg. 291). This is in part because poverty contributes to inferior housing, poor sanitation, lack of adequate food and clothing, inadequate hospital or postnatal medical care, lack of transportation, and more (Gortmaker, 1979, pg. 285). Inferior housing and poor sanitation increase the infant mortality rate because they both increase the risk of infectious disease, which is a leading cause of post-natal infant death (Gortmaker, 1979, pg. 285). Furthermore, the lack of adequate food associated with poverty causes malnutrition, which increases susceptibility to infectious disease, and a lack of adequate transportation makes it exceedingly difficult for impoverished individuals and families to obtain the necessary services to keep the infant and the mother healthy. A study conducted in Nicaragua from 1988 to 1993 further demonstrates the negative effects of poverty and economic inequality on infant mortality; it was found that both social inequity and the absolute poverty increased the risk for infant mortality (Peña *et al*, 2000, pg. 66). Although the

data are not specific to Honduras, Nicaragua and Honduras have many similarities that allow for the application of the study to Honduras. They both have similar infant mortality rates (19 in Nicaragua and 17.7 in Honduras) (CIA World Factbook, November 2016), they both have similar life expectancies at birth (73.5 years in Honduras and 74 years in Nicaragua) (UNICEF, November 2016), and they have similar GINI indices (50.64 in Honduras and 47 in Nicaragua) (World Bank, November 2016).

Additionally, according to Nadine Nowatzki, “wealth inequality is associated with poor population health.” Even after controlling for numerous confounding variables, the inverse correlation between wealth inequality and population health persists and is strongest for female life expectancy and infant mortality (Nowatzki, 2012, pg. 403). A different study also provides valuable insights into the effect of income inequality on infant mortality. The study found that an increase of \$2,000 per year in income (from \$3,000 to \$5,000) reduced the infant mortality rate by a third (a rate of 18.6 per 1,000 versus 27.3 per 1,000) (Gortmaker, 1979, pg. 281). These studies clearly demonstrate the impact that economic factors have on the health of infants. By reducing the poverty rate and economic inequality, Honduras could also reduce its infant mortality rate. Policy measures must be implemented to achieve this, or Honduras will continue to lag behind “developed” countries in infant mortality.

Aside from economic disparities and poverty, perhaps the most significant factor affecting the infant mortality rate in Honduras is the lack of access to health care. When access to health services are limited, infant mortality increases. Although there are no studies available to demonstrate the specific effects of increased availability of health services in Honduras, studies conducted in other countries with similar deficits of access to health services demonstrate the magnitude of the issue. For example, a study conducted in Thailand found that improved access

to medical services decreased infant mortality rates by 13-30%. This was especially true for poor populations (Gruber *et al*, 2014, pg. 16). A separate study in Indonesia found that Improved access to physicians and maternity clinics reduced overall infant mortality rates between 2 and 6.5% (Frankenberg, 1993, pg. 25). Many causes of infant deaths are preventable, especially deaths due to infectious disease, which could have been prevented with adequate medical care. Additionally, access to preventative care can reduce deaths during the neonatal period (the first month of birth). The same study also found that when access to neonatal intensive care increases, infant mortality in low weight and premature births decreases (Gortmaker, 1979, pg. 285). Unfortunately, access to health care in Honduras is very limited. A survey conducted found that 83% of Hondurans lack health insurance (Pearson *et al*, 2012, pg. 1) which is a rough indicator of access to health services (Gortmaker, 1979, pg. 285).

Furthermore, the same survey found that 30% of Hondurans lack any health care at all. This is in part due to an extreme lack of physicians in Honduras. There are roughly .7 physicians per 1,000 people in Honduras, whereas Iceland has 3.6 physicians per 1,000 people (World Bank, November 2016). This is especially evident in rural areas, where 51% of the population resides (Pearson *et al*, 2012, pg. 1). Many rural areas have small health outposts staffed only by auxiliary nurses. Many individuals in rural areas must travel long distances to even reach a health clinic, and when they arrive there is no guarantee that the clinic will be able to care for them. Often times individuals arrive only to discover that the clinic is full and they must therefore return another day (Pearson *et al*, 2012, pg. 1). Honduras has a dire need for an expansion of health care services. Its mothers and infants cannot receive the care they need to survive. Infants waiting for space in neonatal intensive care units account for 56% of newborn deaths in Honduras' largest public hospital. The hospital was designed for 7,000 births annually. In 2013,



there were 22,000 births (Little Angels of Honduras, November 2016). Honduras' need for greater access is clear. Doctors and other health professionals and the health facilities where they work are overwhelmed by the sheer volume of individuals requiring health care. Until Honduras can provide the health care needed by its mothers and babies, its infant mortality rate will continue to remain high.

There are other factors that contribute to infant mortality aside from those mentioned in this paper, such as the quality of health care within a country and health care seeking behavior (Jim Ricca (Physician) in discussion with the author, October 2016). While there is literature to support the importance of these factors in the role of infant mortality, they cannot be applied to Honduras because they are country specific, whereas the topics covered in this paper are readily applicable to a broad range of populations. There was not sufficient academic literature pertaining to health care quality and health care seeking behavior in Honduras to discuss their effects on Honduras' infant mortality rate.

This paper has covered important contributors to the infant mortality rate in Honduras. A high infant mortality rate is a public health crisis, one facing many countries around the world. Although Honduras has reduced their infant mortality rate significantly in the past decade, it is still higher than all "developed" countries'. Lowering the infant mortality rate will not be an easy task, but with proper policymaking that combats economic inequality and poverty, lack of access to and low use of contraception and family planning, lack of maternal education, and poor access to health care, Honduras will be able to continue the reduction of its infant mortality rate.

## Bibliography

- Caldwell, John, and Peter McDonald. "Influence of Maternal Education on Infant and Child Mortality: Levels and Causes." *Health Policy and Education* 2, no. 3-4 (1982): 251-67.
- "Country Comparison :: Infant Mortality Rate." Central Intelligence Agency. Accessed November 12, 2016. <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/rankorder/2091rank.html>.
- Cleland, John, Agustin Conde-Agudelo, Herbert Peterson, John Ross, and Amy Tsui. "Contraception and Health." *The Lancet* 380, no. 9837 (July 10, 2012): 149-56.
- "Family Planning/Contraception." World Health Organization. Accessed November 19, 2016. <http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs351/en/>.
- "Family Planning: Get the Facts about Pregnancy Spacing." Accessed November 19, 2016. <http://www.mayoclinic.org/healthy-lifestyle/getting-pregnant/in-depth/family-planning/art-20044072>.
- Fischetti, Mark. "Female Education Reduces Infant and Childhood Deaths." *Scientific American*. July 07, 2011. Accessed November 19, 2016. <https://www.scientificamerican.com/article/graphic-science-female-education-reduces-infant-childhood-deaths/>.
- Frankenberg, Elizabeth. "The Effects of Access to Health Care on Infant Mortality in Indonesia." RAND, February 14, 1993.
- García, Sandra G., Diana Lara, Sarah H. Landis, Eileen A. Yam, and Suyapa Pavón. "Emergency Contraception in Honduras: Knowledge, Attitudes, and Practice Among Urban Family Planning Clients." *Studies in Family Planning* 37, no. 3 (September 2006): 187-96.
- "GINI Index (World Bank Estimate)." GINI Index (World Bank Estimate) | Data. Accessed November 19, 2016. <http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SI.POV.GINI>.
- Gortmaker, Steven L. "Poverty and Infant Mortality in the United States." *American Sociological Review* 44, no. 2 (April 1979): 280-97.
- Gruber, Jonathan, Nathaniel Hendren, and Robert M. Townsend. "The Great Equalizer: Health Care Access and Infant Mortality in Thailand." *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics* 6, no. 1 (January 2014): 91-107.
- "Health." Country Studies. Accessed November 19, 2016. <http://countrystudies.us/honduras/59.htm>.
- "Honduras Supreme Court Upholds Absolute Ban on Emergency Contraception, Opens Door to Criminalize Women and Medical Professionals." Center for Reproductive Rights.

- February 12, 2013. Accessed November 19, 2016.  
<https://www.reproductiverights.org/press-room/honduras-supreme-court-upholds-absolute-ban-on-emergency-contraception-opens-door-to-crim>.
- Johnston, Jake, and Stephan Lefebvre. "Honduras Since the Coup: Economic and Social Outcomes." Center for Economic and Policy Research. November 2013.  
<http://cepr.net/documents/publications/Honduras-2013-11-final.pdf>.
- "Low Birth Weight." Low Birth Weight Child Health USA 2011. Accessed October 17, 2016.  
<http://mchb.hrsa.gov/chusa11/hstat/hsi/pages/2011bw.html>.
- "Neonatal Death | March of Dimes." March of Dimes. Accessed November 19, 2016.  
<http://www.marchofdimes.org/complications/neonatal-death.aspx>.
- Nowatzki, N. R. "Wealth Inequality and Health: A Political Economy Perspective." *International Journal of Health Services* 42, no. 3 (2012): 403-24.
- "Our Mission - Little Angels of Honduras | Hope." Little Angels of Honduras | Hope. Accessed November 19, 2016. <http://littleangelsofhonduras.org/mission/>.
- Pearson, Catherine A., Michael P. Stevens, Kakotan Sanogo, and Gonzalo M. L. Bearman. "Access and Barriers to Healthcare Vary among Three Neighboring Communities in Northern Honduras." *International Journal of Family Medicine* 2012 (2012): 1-6.
- Peña, Rodolfo, MD, Stig Wall, PhD, and Lars-Åke Persson, MD, PhD. "The Effect of Poverty, Social Inequity, and Maternal Education on Infant Mortality in Nicaragua, 1988-1993." *American Journal of Public Health* 90, no. 1 (January 2000): 64-69.
- "Physicians (per 1,000 People)." Physicians (per 1,000 People) | Data. Accessed November 19, 2016. <http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SH.MED.PHYS.ZS>.
- Pillai, Vijayan K., Arati Maleku, and Fanghsun Wei. "Maternal Mortality and Female Literacy Rates in Developing Countries during 1970–2000: A Latent Growth Curve Analysis." *International Journal of Population Research* 2013 (November 15, 2013): 1-11.
- "POVERTY AND INFANT MORTALITY - NYTimes.com." *New York Times*. February 21, 1982. <http://www.nytimes.com/1982/02/21/style/poverty-and-infant-mortality.html>.
- "Pregnancy Week by Week." Mayo Clinic. Accessed November 19, 2016.  
<http://www.mayoclinic.org/healthy-lifestyle/pregnancy-week-by-week/in-depth/pregnancy-nutrition/art-20045082>.
- "Stanford Children's Health." Stanford Children's Health - Lucile Packard Children's Hospital Stanford. Accessed November 19, 2016.  
<http://www.stanfordchildrens.org/en/topic/default?id=low-birthweight-90-P02382>.

- “Statistics | At a Glance: Honduras | UNICEF." UNICEF. December 27, 2013.  
[http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/honduras\\_statistics.html](http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/honduras_statistics.html).
- “Statistics | At a Glance: Iceland | UNICEF." UNICEF. December 27, 2013.  
[http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/iceland\\_statistics.html](http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/iceland_statistics.html).
- “Statistics | At a Glance: Nicaragua | UNICEF." UNICEF. December 27, 2013.  
[http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/nicaragua\\_statistics.html](http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/nicaragua_statistics.html).
- “Teen Pregnancy & Health Risks to the Baby." Health Communities. Accessed November 19, 2016. <http://www.healthcommunities.com/teen-pregnancy/children/overview-of-teen-pregnancy.shtml>.
- Toruño, David Alexander Figueroa. "Summarized Account of Family Planning in Honduras." Asociación Latinoamericana De Población. Accessed October 17, 2016.  
[http://www.alapop.org/alap/SerieInvestigaciones/InvestigacionesSIIaSi9/DemogTransformations\\_PartIII-7.pdf](http://www.alapop.org/alap/SerieInvestigaciones/InvestigacionesSIIaSi9/DemogTransformations_PartIII-7.pdf).
- “WHO | Adolescent Pregnancy." WHO. Accessed November 19, 2016.  
[http://www.who.int/maternal\\_child\\_adolescent/topics/maternal/adolescent\\_pregnancy/en/](http://www.who.int/maternal_child_adolescent/topics/maternal/adolescent_pregnancy/en/)
- “WHO | Family Planning/Contraception." World Health Organization. May 2015.  
<http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs351/en/>.
- “WHO | Maternal and Perinatal Health." WHO. Accessed November 19, 2016.  
[http://www.who.int/maternal\\_child\\_adolescent/topics/maternal/maternal\\_perinatal/en/](http://www.who.int/maternal_child_adolescent/topics/maternal/maternal_perinatal/en/).
- “Why Focus on Infant Mortality." Accessed November 12, 2016.  
<http://www.amchp.org/programsandtopics/dataassessment/InfantMortalityToolkit/Documents/Why Focus on IM.pdf>.
- Zola, Heddy. "The Development of Antibody Responses in the Infant." Immunology and Cell Biology 75, no. 6 (1997): 587-90. Accessed November 19, 2016.

## **China: A Poor State in a Rich-State Dominated World Trade Regime**

**By William Noble**

Richard Nixon will forever be remembered for two things. He is remembered for the Watergate Scandal, continually demonstrating how imperfect leaders can be. Indeed, more positively, he is remembered for opening the door to China, expanding a relationship that would soon result in the United States serving as China's biggest trade partner. Since 1978, China's centrally planned economy has embraced liberalization and experienced staggering economic growth. The Chinese economy has grown exponentially, much to the confusion of the academic community. China certainly has asserted itself since then on a global scale, becoming the second largest economy in the world and becoming an influential member in the World Trade Organization. Amidst China's growth, some criticism surrounds the structure of China's economy and some of their trading practices. Among these, most notably is currency devaluation. This paper will thoroughly discuss the elements of the rise of the Chinese economy and its relationship and effect on the global trade regime. Accordingly, this paper will argue that given China's new growth, influence in the World Trade Organization, and dedication to liberalization, China is a poor state, but a valuable and gainful member of the World Trade Organization, and a welcome addition to the global trade community.

To begin, it is important to understand that China has not always been an economic powerhouse. The People's Republic of China was founded in 1949, and from its inception it was a centrally planned economy. Mao Zedong was the founder of the Communist Party of China (CPC) and dictator of the Peoples Republic of China until his death in 1976. His approach to governance is known as Mao Zedong thought, which was simply Leninism-Marxism as defined by Chairman Mao. Prior to Chinese decentralization, The People's Republic of China entered

into negligible trade of raw materials for other non-domestic, desired materials. China's trading numbers were less than noteworthy. In 1978, China accounted for less than one percent of global trade, amounting to a mere 20.6 billion dollars. That same year, after the end of the cultural revolution, the new Chinese government brought about serious reform to China's economy, stressing a more globally-minded trade agenda. Desiring to spark economic growth, the Chinese government allowed the establishment of business and private enterprise. Moving towards a more free-trade understanding or rationality, China "invested in industrial production and the education of its workforce" (Hu). Perhaps the most important aspect of the new Chinese economy was the expansion of foreign trade. Without the paradigm shift, China's economy would not have been able to experience the growth the economy saw during the 1980s. Trade was the centerpiece of China's economic growth. The 1980s saw the increase of imports and exports, while the growth disproportionately favored exports. China made itself competitive in the marketplace by trying their hand at producing the very things they were importing. The Chinese followed an import substitution model which advocates producing domestically goods that would traditionally be imported. In this way, China sought to make itself less dependent on foreign goods while also hoping to boost the demand and production of those goods domestically. As such, China had a trade surplus in the early 80s. The rest of the decade however would be marked by trade deficits for China. The unchecked market sought to balance out the surpluses that China was garnering. Imports increased due to "the expansion of foreign reserves, the decentralized management of foreign trade, and large purchases of foreign plant and equipment for domestic production" (Li, 3). However committed to liberalization China was at the onset of their determination to decentralize their economy, was not enduring. They did not look fondly upon running trade deficits. The Chinese were looking to get ahead domestically,

no matter the cost to the greater global trade regime. The Chinese did not, in practice, as is evident by their response to trade deficits, view themselves better off if the whole global trading community was better off. In response to the mid to late 80s increase in imports, the Chinese put in place some protectionist policies that would give their domestic producers an upper hand. The Chinese would respond by increasing control over foreign exchange expenditures and even implementing an “import and export licensing system” (Li). China’s mercantilist response balanced out trade deficits during the 1980s. Ultimately, China’s turn towards trade in the 80s did wonders for its economy and rapidly increased their GDP. Tremendous gains were made, and by then end of the 1980s, only ten years after, China represented three times as much of world trade.

It becomes important to understand how China catapulted from 3 percent of the global trade to an economic hegemon. China made its rise on the “vast supply of low-cost labor” (Das). Home to more than one billion people and the world’s most populous country, China used to their advantage the readily available and large labor force for labor intensive sectors of the economy. According to Zhiwu Chen, a professor of Finance at Yale School of Management, China became the center of “global textile development” and was able to produce and assemble textiles, consumables, toys, and other trinkets for the world over, and cheaply (Hayat). While specialized products and advanced technology was being produced by countries such as Japan and the United States, the demand for these textiles still existed. China’s growth truly was from “low skilled, low technology,” labor intensive markets. China capitalized on this as the cost to produce these goods was minimal and the labor force was abundant. China could export these goods to most of the world as developed countries turned towards more advanced industries. This led to China becoming the world’s largest exporter of merchandise (Cohn). While China

has to import these more advanced technologies, its exports are in such demand that they hold trade surpluses with multiple developed countries, the largest of which with the United States of \$365.694 billion as of 2015 (U.S. Census Bureau). It is important to note the effect of physical capital, large population, and sizeable demand of exports to China's growth. However, the effect of worker productivity substantially added to China's rapid rise. Capital stock increase during the reform period in China played an invaluable role, but by the 90s, "productivity gains" accounted for more of China's GDP growth than capital investment and accumulation did. Worker efficiency increased (Hu). IMF research finds that capital investment in new technology and infrastructure along with "profit incentives" to "family farms," "small private businesses, and foreign investors and traders" caused the tremendous increase in economic efficiency (Hu).

### **China's Influence in WTO and Effect on Global Trade Regime**

The Chinese government has taken steps to become more involved in trade norms and take an active role in affecting change in the global trade regime. In 2001, China gained entrance into the World Trade Organization, or the WTO. Upon receiving member status, China was obliged to all the same rules and conditions all other members must. It required that China continue with the liberalization of its economy. The World Trade Organization works to further free trade and globalization. In that effort, there are certain norms which the WTO believes are crucial to the health of the global trade regime such as most favored nation status and nondiscrimination. Most-favored-nation status (MFN) requires that any advantage provided a nation in trade must immediately and unequivocally be provided to any other nation with the most-favored-nation status. Inherent in the MFN are the norms of reciprocity and nondiscrimination. The inclusion of China in the WTO lends them credibility and allows other actors to feel more comfortable trading with them.



Actions taken by China in the Doha round go a long way to establish trustworthiness not just among fellow members of the G-20 but also among trade giants like the United States and the E.U. China has taken an interest in global governance, and their particular interest and work in the Doha round informs the international community in two ways. First, China is looking to continue liberalizing their economy and expanding free trade. Second, and arguably more important, China is seeking to make only adjustments to the logistical operation of the WTO. They are not seeking an overhaul of the system or bowing out to go rogue when they do not get their way.

More specifically, in the Doha round, China made multiple proposals that would both further their agenda but also help developing countries. China proposed a change to the selection of the Trade Negotiation Committee which exercises tremendous authority over the agenda setting process for negotiations (Hongsong). This body's head is traditionally selected by the WTO Director-general. China along with many other "developing countries" proposed that the chairman of this committee would be filled on a rotating basis by member ambassadors (Hongsong). This committee is almost entirely composed of developed countries, and China had feared that the developed countries would have almost uncheckable authority to set the agenda of the Doha round (Hongsong).

Additionally, at the Doha round, China proposed a restructuring of the dispute settlement mechanism of the WTO. The dispute settlement mechanism, DSM, is a method by which members of the WTO may pursue legal ramifications for infractions of the WTO's trade norms and solve trade disputes (WTO). China argues that developed countries have better access to the service the WTO provides, and that the DSM disproportionately serves those with the "expertise and administrative capacity" (Liu). This assertion would mean that the DSM would not be

equally accessible to least developed countries. This might not necessarily affect China. While China is a developing country, it is an economic hegemon who has access to at least sufficient council. The question of the degree to which China is on the outside of the inner circle of the most powerful members and their good graces is legitimate. However, as a leader in the G-20, China is charged with promoting the needs of the developing countries who have given China their good faith. China's proposal contains language that suggests that developed countries should "maintain a proper restraint" from pursuing legal action or bringing grievances before the DSM when they entangle developing countries (Hongong). The same proposal requests that developed countries not be empowered to bring forth more than two disputes during a calendar year against the same developing country, while developing countries would still be privileged to filing more than two disputes against the same developed country in a single calendar year (Hongsong). Another similar action China took in the Doha round was to purpose reform to the contentious anti-dumping issue. China and many countries including the U.S., Egypt, Canada, and India conveyed the desire to reform the WTO's legal language about anti-dumping (Hongsong). The WTO has been very clear about promoting a culture of fair-trade (Principles of the Trading System). Dumping is defined as foreign companies selling their products in foreign markets at lower than market value. Dumping is explained to be a barrier to free trade because it decreases the efficacy or competitiveness of domestic producers. Anti-dumping sentiment is fueled by belief that domestic companies cannot produce at such a low price which will ultimately drive them out of business. The worst fear is that when foreign companies have out-competed domestic firms in a particular market, consumers will be forced to pay "monopoly price" (Johnson). In 2003, China proposed that the World Trade Organization begin enforcing their anti-dumping policies more rigorously (Won-Mog). The WTO does not enforce these

regulations too strictly since it becomes difficult to determine who is at fault and if any “real” damage had been done. The Chinese desire culturally relevant or case by case relevant rulings on each individual investigation. Their efforts were in hopes that the developed countries would no longer use anti-dumping rules systematically to restrict trade with certain WTO members. Further, the Chinese sought to have the rules on anti-dumping clarified and further defined. The Chinese argued that when assessing or addressing suspicions of dumping behaviors, there needed to be specific and clearly explained “factors” that needed “consideration” (Hongsong). The most startling aspect of China’s purposive behavior in the Doha round regarding anti-dumping regulations is that it sought to make these restrictions harder, while having been the most “targeted” and suspected of “anti-dumping” actions (Lamy). While being, at least in the view of other members of the World Trade Organization, the worst offender of dumping, China conveyed its desire to crack down on dumping behaviors. One could argue that the China is not just abiding by the WTO’s trading norm of fair trade, but seeking out reform in an area that affects them and other developing countries. Not only are they advocating increasing and enforcing stronger anti-dumping laws and committing themselves to follow them, they are also aware that the members of WTO is watching them and holding them accountable. This move shows commitment to liberalization of their economy and advancement of the common good in the WTO. China is seeking to level the playing field for the developing countries that may be preyed upon and not get access to all that is entitled to members. This can be viewed as an effort to build up and promote liberalization, a commitment to extending free trade to all, even if it requires assistance to get developing countries to a point they are able to trade without being marginalized.

Dependency theorists contend that developed countries actually end up pushing down on developing countries, marginalizing them. They break global trade into two parts, the dominant or center and dependent or periphery (Hopper). Proponents of these theories say that all countries have some level of vulnerability and sensitivity that determines a country's level of dependency, and this is a sort of continuum. If a state is sensitive, it has certain assets to offset its vulnerability. A state is vulnerable if it has serious issues that affect its ability to trade, like weather or trade deficit. These scholars say that in effort to create global interdependence, the global trade regime misses some. Dependency and world systems theorists say that some of these states are so "asymmetrically interdependent" that they are dependent. These vulnerable, dependent states face unfair terms of trade. Their resources are limited. They are usually primary commodity exporters. These primary exporters face high elasticity of demand and competition—compounding issues include the need to import many other resources and the need to produce what no one else has to anymore. One can argue this is what China was trying to help combat. China's action at the WTO can be characterized as responsible and substantive, at least at the structural level inside the WTO. This proposal behavior proves to other members that China can be a valuable and legitimate addition to the WTO and the global trade regime.

Discussion of dependency theory and China's actions on behalf of the G-20 prompt the question does China really qualify as a developing nation? Does China struggle in the same way that other South states do? China fits some of the characteristics of a developing nation as is evident by their actions in the WTO. More specifically, their aforementioned actions and others like fighting for special and deferential treatment highlight the unique position in which China operates. Special and differential treatment is described as least developed countries' (LDCs) exemptions from select WTO rules and regulations (Cohn). These exceptions to WTO norms are

made only to countries who fall behind in implementing requirements from previous rounds and would actually be at a disadvantage if required to show compliance. During the negotiations for China's ascension to the WTO, China was considered a LDC. China requested protections as a LDC, however, many members believed China's size and rapid growth precluded it from LDC protections. China desired the WTO to overlook or grant exception for protectionist policies to safeguard its growing domestic markets. They also pursued GSP, looking to bolster domestic production and assert the effectiveness of their export-heavy growth model (Cohn). WTO would not grant them these requests, but did allow China to have an extended period of time to implement provisions from subsequent rounds. This behavior in addition with China's export dependency and low per capita income corroborate the claim that China is a developing country. China's role in seeking to expand access to and reform the DSM and proactively proposing to strengthen anti-dumping measures points to its commitment to cultivating a stronger, pro-development shift in global governance. However, China's size and reluctance to take the lead in some G-20 proposals on some issues such as agriculture shows aspects of a developed country. China contributed to the exchange of ideas, as they benefit when DCs reduce subsidies and allow greater market access to LDCs, but they did not wish to pressure too much. Likewise, China had no oppositions to the norms of the WTO, and further, in some regards they requested clarified, deeper, and broader provisions to protect them (Hongsong).

China, as a poor state, has positively affected the WTO in other ways than give weight to the concerns of LDCs and desire clarified, strengthened rules regarding WTO norms. China has helped to bolster South-South trade. China began seeking out trade with other developing countries. Due to China's leadership, other LDCs are engaging in trade with other LDCs, sometimes for the first time. Countries like Brazil and India are gaining ground in trade. LDC

trade in 2011 had a higher forecast growth rate than that among DCs. Now, South-South trade accounts for twenty percent of global trade, due to China's efforts (Lamy).

### **China's Dark Side**

Many DCs in the WTO chastise China for devaluing its currency in order to make its goods and domestic markets more profitable. The United States has been one of the loudest in denouncing China's currency devaluation. China's manipulation of currency began years ago during the reform era when China was an aspiring economic hegemon venturing to maintain its unprecedented growth. In 1994, China decidedly ended "the dual-track exchange rate system" (Li). Instead, China imagined a single rate that would be pegged to the U.S. dollar. The renminbi would depreciate by 44% and remain with almost no exchange rate variation for eleven years (Li). There was an effect. China's goods were already cheap. Wage rates were low and tariffs were reduced in anticipation of joining the WTO. Currency devaluation added to an already export-heavy Chinese economy. Many DCs are not necessarily incentivized to take express or deliberate action China's actions considering so many of their biggest employers and largest multinationals are enjoying the sums they save doing manufacturing business in China (Navarro). To expound, 40% of Chinese exports assembled or produced in China are owned by American companies (Shijian). DCs benefit from the relative cheaper labor and the almost subsidized export of their goods to other countries. DCs' consumers enjoy the cheaper goods, especially if they have lost a job due to manufacturing outsourcing. Economic liberals say that the the consumer is better off when goods are cheaper, and that responding with mercantilist policies to protect workforce at home hurts globalization and free trade. China is aware of the distaste the international trade community has for their actions. They have made progress in appreciating their currency. The renminbi has appreciated by 31.4% over the last ten years,

which is far more than DCs had hoped for (Roach). China in certain bilateral relationships and even as an influential member of the WTO, proves too beneficial a trade partner for DCs to force their hands in the currency battle. DCs should cut their losses and appreciate their gains, as rising wage rates and diminished growth in labor force and continued necessity for China's exports seem to test the likelihood that total currency normalization will come to fruition.

To conclude, the once centrally planned Chinese economy has grown extensively over the last thirty years during the reform period. Making efforts to liberalize its economy, China grew when it looked externally and saw growth potential in foreign trade. Cheap, available labor, increased productivity, and an export-driven economic model allowed China to become the hegemon it is today. Seeking membership in the WTO, China showed the global community good faith by being faithful to make efforts to liberalize their economy, (e.g. reducing tariffs and opening their markets to foreign investors.) Since its ascension to the WTO, China has demonstrated influence and added value by leading and championing causes of developing countries. China has shown respect for the trade norms of the WTO as well as desire for the expansion of liberalization and attainable free trade for LDCs. China's efforts have even encouraged South-South trade. While DCs may question some of China's actions, like currency devaluation, China is a irreplaceable asset to the global trade regime.

## Works Cited

- Amann, Edmund, Barry Lau, and Frederick Nixon. "Did China Hurt The Textiles and Clothing Exports of Other Asian Economies, 1990-2005?" *Oxford Developmental Studies* 37.4 (2009): 333-362. Web. 06 Mar. 2016.
- Cohn, Theodore H. "Global Trade Relations; Concluding Comments." *Global Political Economy: Theory and Practice*. 6<sup>th</sup> ed. Boston: Longman, (2012): 193, 394.
- Das, Mitali, and Papa N'Diaye. "Chronicle of a Decline Foretold: Has China Reached the Lewis Turning Point?" *International Monetary Fund* 13/26 (2013): 3-18. 24 Mar. 2016
- Hayat, Usman. "What Explains China's Economic Growth, and Is It Sustainable?" *Enterprising Investor*. CFA Institute, (2011). 26 Mar. 2016.
- Hongsong, Liu. "China's Proposing Behavior in Global Governance: the Cases of the WTO Doha Round Negotiation and G-20 Process." *Revista Brasileira Internacional* 57. (2014): 121-137. 23 Mar. 2016.
- Hopper, Paul. *Understanding Development: Issues and Debates*. Cambridge, U.K.: Polity, 2012. Print.
- Hu, Zulu, and Mohsin S. Khan. "Why is China Growing So Fast?" *Economic Issues* 8. International Monetary Fund. (1997) 20 Mar. 2016
- Johnson, Bryan T. "A Guide to Antidumping Laws: America's Unfair Trade Practice." *The Heritage Foundation*. (1992) 28 Mar. 2016
- Lamy, Pascal. "China's Role in the WTO." Interview by Paula M. Miller. *China Business Review* 2010: 25 Mar. 2016
- Li, Xiaojun. "China as a Trading Superpower." *London School of Economics and Political Science* (2014): 1-7. 19 Mar. 2016.
- Li, Xing, and Timothy M. Shaw. "'Same Bed, Different Dream' and 'Riding Tiger' Dilemmas: China's Rise and International Relations/Political Economy." *Journal of Chinese Political Science* (2014): 2-26. Web. 06 Mar. 2016.
- Navarro, Peter. "China's Currency Manipulation." *World Affairs* 175.3 (2012): 27-37 15 Mar. 2016
- "Principles of the Trading System." *WTO*. World Trade Organization, 2016. 22 Mar. 2016
- Roach, Stephen S. "Blaming China is Tempting—but Wrong." *World Affairs* 175.3 (2012): 31-37. 15 Mar. 2016



Shijian, Zhou. "U.S. Trade with China: More Good Than Harm by Far." *China US Focus*. (2012). 21

"U.S. Trade with China." *Foreign Trade*. U.S. Census Bureau, 2016. 28 Mar. 2016

Won-Mog, Choi, and Henry S Gao. "Procedural Issues in the Anti-Dumping Regulations of China: A Critical Review under the WTO Rules." *Chinese Journal of International Law* 5.3 (2006): 20 Mar. 2016

## **Vietnam's Sustainable Future**

**By Tricia Prevost**

In a world developed by fossil fuels and capitalism, historically colonized states have been at a disadvantage; they are typically poor, mainly export primary commodities, and have contributed little to environmental degradation but will be the most highly affected. Given the economic and environmental tradeoffs of sustainable development, how can Vietnam achieve the most sustainable growth and build on current progress? With its steady rate of economic growth since the 1990s, Vietnam has been and must continue to seek solutions to be a more energy accessible and sustainable state. Vietnam can seek financial and technological investment from wealthy countries and international organizations as well as develop sustainable policies in energy, agriculture, and development.

Sustainability has been broadly defined as the ability to meet the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. Sustainability has many facets that go beyond only environmental protection, and the United Nations has 17 sustainable development goals which range from poverty eradication to affordable, clean energy. When the entire global economy has been built based on the use of fossil fuels, any change to that system can be met with challenges. The unsustainable extraction of fuels damages our earth and heavy carbon-based fuel use in factories, transportation, and the production of electricity has contributed to greenhouse gas emissions and global warming. The states that have lead this carbon-fueled development are the most responsible for environmental degradation, but poor and underdeveloped states will face the harshest consequences. The history of sustainable development has been riddled with failed attempts to urge states to do their part. The Rio Earth Summit of 1992 sought to bring attention to the global crisis of climate change, and over 150

countries signed on to the two treaties and three nonbinding agreements, but the following years saw a lackluster response to the challenges of sustainability (Hadden et al. 2016, p. 1-3). The concept of sustainable development struggled to become a global norm, which Hadden dubbed a “failure to launch,” and despite international agreements it had trouble translating into meaningful action (Hadden et al. 2016, p. 4-5). In 2002, states reconvened in Johannesburg to reopen discussion on sustainability. By reexamining the definition and goals of sustainability, there was increased consensus and understanding of its purpose among states, but progress remained sporadic. Finally, at the Rio+20 conference in 2012, the attempt to reinvigorate the sustainability agenda proved optimistic in the midst of a global economic crisis (Hadden et al. 2016, p. 13). After over 20 years of struggling to make substantial progress towards sustainable development, the norm of sustainability seems stronger than ever, and the historic Paris Climate Agreement of 2014 lends hope for rich and poor states to work towards this common goal.

Through a mix of a growing economy, urbanization, and the threat of climate change, Vietnam will need to find ways to sustainably produce power. According to the United Nations, Vietnam has had a steady GDP growth rate of about 6% and though it has a solid portion of its economy dedicated to agriculture—around 18%—it has growing industrial and service sectors (UN, Vietnam country profile). Vietnam’s solid growth throughout the recent global recession could be due to its relative isolation from global markets; it has benefitted from China’s growing power while being unencumbered by weak markets in recent years. With rapid urbanization and industrial growth, Vietnam has had to produce more energy to meet its needs. It has vast reserves of coal and natural gas to be tapped into (CIA Factbook), but the ever-looming threats of climate change and sea level rise puts Vietnam in a bad position to be adding to environmental degradation. Vietnam’s coastal geography leaves it particularly vulnerable to sea-level rise and

natural hazards. The agricultural hub of Vietnam, the Mekong River Delta, is especially at risk, therefore Vietnam's food security is at stake. Vietnam currently produces a portion of its energy through hydroelectric power (CIA World Factbook), but much of its potential has not been reached. Vietnam also has plans for nuclear energy, and though this form of power has its own environmental risks, it would be a more reliable and larger source for growing energy needs than wind or solar (Symon 2008, p. 4). In recent years Vietnam has set long-term goals for energy development, with emphasis on renewable energy development and cutting greenhouse gas emissions all while facing the challenge of a rapidly developing country (Asian Development Bank 2015, p. 20-21). These policy goals demonstrate the commitment of Vietnam towards mitigating and preventing the impacts of climate change. The implementation of these goals may be slow due to their scale and the benefits may not be spread equally, but they are important steps towards a sustainable state. Though Vietnam could benefit financially from use of its available fossil fuels, the necessity of more sustainable modes of development could not be clearer.

Vietnam is developing rapidly but has large pockets of poverty in urban and rural areas, and with a GDP of \$180 billion (UN, Vietnam country profile), is still considered a poor state. In its current financial capacity, Vietnam cannot address both its poverty and sustainable development alone. Therefore, it would behoove Vietnam to seek investment from wealthy nations—such as the United States or South Korea—in its energy sector. Though the US and Vietnam have had an unsteady relationship in recent decades; in 2014, President Obama released a statement to Congress detailing his approval of Vietnam's use of nuclear energy. He wrote, "The proposed [Agreement for Cooperation between the Government of the United States of America and the Government of the Socialist Republic of Vietnam Concerning Peaceful Uses of

Nuclear Energy] has been negotiated in accordance with the [Atomic Energy Act of 1954] and other applicable law. In my judgment, it meets all applicable statutory requirements and will advance the nonproliferation and other foreign policy interests of the United States” (President Obama 2014). The message to Congress makes no promise of monetary investment in Vietnam’s nuclear development, but instead direct technological assistance under strict guidelines which promote the interests of both states. Other efforts by the US to help Vietnam include the development and establishment of English language programs (Peace Corps 2016). The Peace Corps has agricultural and environmental programs in other countries, so the implementation of similar programs in Vietnam is not far behind; this form of educational investment by the US government is yet another step towards sustainable development in Vietnam. Not only does better primary education help reduce poverty, but agricultural and environmental education can reduce environmental impacts by farms and businesses.

Additionally to US involvement, nearby South Korea could be an asset to Vietnam’s sustainable development goals. South Korea’s post-World War II development was the product of the United States’ effort to rebuild the regional economy (Gray 2013, p. 2). South Korea had received about the same amount of aid as South Vietnam, but South Korea was more politically stable in this time, which allowed for more consistent and powerful development (Gray 2013, p. 8). Given South Korea and Vietnam’s comparable pasts as colonized states, and South Korea’s later rise as a NIC in the 1980s, South Korea could be an example and leader for Vietnam’s development. South Korea is also has a highly developed technological sector, and its capital city of Seoul is incredibly prosperous. South Korea designed a development plan for the Red River delta which included high-density development, flood control, and urban parkland in Hanoi (*Planning* 2011, p. 1). The plan was ultimately rejected by the Vietnamese government

due to the issue of the relocation of 150,000 residents and the concern of the negative effects on downstream flow (*Planning* 2011, p. 1). Though the development would have benefitted Hanoi's economic development, the environmental consequences would be detrimental in the long run. In terms of sustainability, Hanoi would be better off investing in greenspaces and forms of electricity that do not require the displacement of its citizens or sacrifice other crucial facets of sustainability. The Vietnamese government has clear goals towards sustainability, but needs the expertise and aid of more developed countries to implement these plans.

Investment from wealthy states is not the only pathway towards sustainable development for Vietnam. In June of 2016, the World Bank promised to help strengthen Vietnam's sustainable policy agenda with a \$90 million credit for policy reforms aligned with the World Bank's Climate Change Action Plan (World Bank 2016). The World Bank specified these funds for "the implementation of policies to improve integrated coastal zone planning and management, public investments related to climate change and green growth, protection of water resources and greater water use efficiency, as well as coastal forest development" as well as industrial improvements in air quality, energy efficiency, and renewable sources of energy (World Bank 2016). This credit to Vietnam is part of the government's Support Program to Respond to Climate Change and is led by its Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources, which has the goal of promoting green policy in the state. Aid from the World Bank as well as policy promises by the Vietnamese government are in preparation for the implementation of the UN Paris Climate Change Conference, of which Vietnam is a signatory; Vietnam ratified its portion of the agreement in November 2016. The United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), in conjunction with other UN programs and international organizations, is aiding Vietnam in the implementation of its ratified climate change agreement. The five main

components—mitigation of GHG emissions, adaptation to climate change, implementation resources, improved transparency systems, and institutions and policies—are to be achieved by 2030 (UNDP 2016). The United Nations has also taken steps to help poor states cooperate with other poor states to share innovative technologies and policies to adapt to climate change (Rowlands 2016). States in the Global South can have a unique advantage to developing affordable and effective solutions to issues facing them due to a lack of funds for research and development. The UN Office of South-South Cooperation has developed a network of think tanks which will enable institutions in poor countries to exchange and develop more specific and accessible Vietnam cannot achieve these goals alone, but international organizations can aid in Vietnam's sustainable development through planning, leadership, and disbursement of credit and funds.

Not only does Vietnam need to produce reliably clean energy, it also needs to protect its agricultural sector and ensure safeguards against environmental degradation through sustainable practices in the fertile Mekong Delta. These practices must go beyond accessible energy because conventional agriculture and its wastes have more direct affects to the environment than air pollution. The primary reason for environmental degradation due to waste emissions in rural villages is the lack of education of the negative impacts and how to amend harmful practices; also, waste treatment systems have a high cost associated with their construction and use. In a study by Le Thanh Hai et al., they sought to develop and test a sustainable waste treatment and recycling system to improve the livelihood and environmental wellbeing of a household in the Dong Thap province of the Mekong Delta area (Hai et al. 2015, p. 1). The model primarily focused on livestock waste treatment and recycling due to the popularity of crop/livestock farms in the region; this model of farm makes it easy to recycle livestock waste to be used as organic

fertilizer, therefore reducing the cost and environmental impact of using synthetic fertilizers. The main components of the model to be used in a household included a system for waste separation, a system for compost, a system for biogas use, a gas cooker in the kitchen, an earthworm feeding system, and a constructed wetland (Hai et al. 2015, p. 5). The waste separation system allows for manure and urine to be appropriated for treatment and recycling; once the manure is dried it can be used as an effective organic fertilizer (Hai et al. 2015, p. 5). Composting is an integral part of any sustainable farming operation; crop wastes, weeds, and food scraps can be compiled and decomposed to be reused as fertilizer (Hai et al. 2015, p. 6). The biogas system has a double advantage in that it produces fuel for the home by decomposing waste and that surplus methane gas can be stored and sold for profit (though this is a carbon-based fuel, it is developed from modern sources and therefore the produced carbon is mitigated by plant growth) (Hai et al. 2015, p. 1). The household can use their biogas for cooking and become more energy independent. The earthworm breeding and feeding system is also supplied by food scraps and manure, and the earthworms produced provide important ecological benefits to the soil and crops, which reduces the need for tilling which can cause soil erosion; they can also be used to clean wastewater (Hai et al. 2015, p. 7). The final component is a constructed wetland, which helps filter out nutrients such as nitrogen and phosphorus from water runoff which can degrade groundwater quality; a pond is built surrounded by wetland plants which filter out excess nutrients and provide cleaner water and reduce pollution (Hai et al. 2015, p. 1). This comprehensive waste treatment system in the model household may not be cost effective for most homes, but simply implementing a few of the sustainable practices outlined would reduce pollution and save money for families.

The trend away from conventional agricultural practices to more sustainable techniques and technologies is a needed improvement for Vietnam's environmental wellbeing. However,



the necessity of ensuring food security cannot be ignored, and one of the largest factors in providing food for Vietnam's population is sustainable land use. Climate change exacerbates the vulnerability of rural and urban communities alike and even with efficient use and recycling of resources, natural disasters can inhibit or reverse progress. With Vietnam's delicate river valley ecosystems, even a 5% loss of land due to sea level rise or storms can reduce rice yields by five million tons each year (Davis 2016, p. 6). The effects of climate change-related weather events can be mitigated by efficient farming practices or genetically modified crops that produce more yield on less land. Also, rising average temperatures can make crops more susceptible to pests and disease (Davis 2016, p. 7), so crops naturally resistant to pests would be a better solution than traditional methods of pest management by pesticide use.

Natural threats to food security may be unavoidable, but another impending concern is the encroachment of developers on agricultural land, specifically in the Mekong delta (Davis 2016, p.6). Vietnam's growing population will increase food demand and place the pressure on poor rice farmers to produce larger yields of rice and other products on less land, another reason for the use of genetically modified high-yield crops. Urban development, if not done sustainably, can cause pollution that would be detrimental to down-river agricultural lands, going so far as to damage water sources and diminish biodiversity. Instead of developing on farmable land, the Vietnamese government could incentivize research and development of technologies and crops to ensure food security for its citizens as the looming risk of sea-level rise threatens to place a growing population in a food scarcity situation. Cooperation of farmers, developers, and the government to promote sustainable land use can help in lessening the impact of one of the many consequences of climate change.

The consensus on the existence of climate change is widely accepted and there are extensive studies and models that present the urgency of the situation. Climate change and its related severe weather events can affect any part of the globe, but wealthy states will be affected less harshly than poor states which may not have the infrastructure or funds to handle disasters. However, there are many climate change deniers, who range from businessmen to Congressmen who reject these studies and use studies suggesting the impossibility of such global changes. Others say government regulation to reduce carbon emissions only hinder progress and that the market will adjust to be more sustainable as fossil fuel resources deplete. These arguments are refuted by the vast majority of the scientific community as completely fabricated or that enough damage has been done and immediate and deliberate action must be taken. Though poor states will be disproportionately affected by climate change, some still desire to develop as colonizing countries developed, or what is called the right to develop. India and other emerging economies feel they are entitled to the same fossil-driven development that China and the United States have experienced and insist a sudden cut in emissions or transfer to renewables could slow or damage economic growth. The Paris Climate Summit sought to address these concerns, and included commitments from wealthy states to contribute assistance to the efforts of poor states to cut emissions (Barry 2015). Despite disagreements on methods of sustainable development or the urgency of climate change, the international community has taken great strides to show its pledge to protect our earth and its resources, while aiding poor states in the struggle.

In conclusion, Vietnam's future is contingent on the government's ability to build on current sustainable initiatives while also seeking outside help to protect its resources, environment, and food security. Financial aid and investment can come from a number of resources, and technological solutions are being developed in even the poorest states. Protecting

agricultural lands and food security will benefit both urban and rural areas and ensure a safe and sustainable future in Vietnam. Progress may be slow and more creative measures to implement affordable solutions are a necessity, but the issue of climate change extends beyond Vietnam and will surely affect the global community.

## Bibliography

- Asian Development Bank (2015). Viet Nam: Energy Sector Assessment, Strategy, and Road Map.
- Barry, F. (21 December 2015). A Climate Deal Worth Celebrating. *Bloomberg Businessweek*.
- CIA World Fact Book. (2014). Vietnam. Vol. 51.
- Davis, E. (2016). Sustainable development in Vietnam: The interconnectedness of climate change, socio-economic development, land use, and food security. *Pursuit: The Journal of Undergraduate Research at the University of Tennessee*, Vol. 7.
- Gray, K. (2013). Aid and development in Taiwan, South Korea, and South Vietnam. *World Institute for Development Economic Research (UNU-WIDER)*.
- Hadden, J., & Seybert, L.A. (2016). What's in a norm? Mapping the norm definition process in the debate on sustainable development. *Global Governance*, Vol. 22.
- Hai, L.T., Schnitzer, H., Van Thanh, T., Thao, N.T.P., & Braunegg, G. (2016). An integrated eco-model of agriculture and small-scale industry in craft villages toward cleaner production and sustainable development in rural areas—a case study from Mekong delta of Viet Nam. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 137.
- Is Seoul a Model for Hanoi? (2011). *Planning*, Vol. 77, issue 9.
- Khuong, V.M. (2015). Can Vietnam achieve more robust economic growth? Insights from a comparative analysis of economic reforms in Vietnam and China. *Journal of Southeast Asian Economies*, Vol. 32.
- Obama, B. (2014). Message to the Congress Transmitting the Agreement for Cooperation Between the United States and Vietnam on the Peaceful Uses of Nuclear Energy.
- Peace Corps. (23 May 2016). *Viet Nam to Welcome Peace Corps for First Time*.
- Phan, T.H., & Jeong, J.Y. (2016). Potential economic impacts of the Vietnam-Korea free trade agreement on Vietnam. *Journal of East Asian Economic Integration*, Vol. 20.
- Rowlands, L. (2016). Developing Countries Innovative Drivers of Sustainable Development. *Inter Press Service*.
- Symon, A. (2009). Southeast Asia's Nuclear Power Thrust: Putting ASEAN's Effectiveness to the Test? *Contemporary Southeast Asia: A Journal of International & Strategic Affairs*, Vol. 30.
- UN Data Retrieval System. (2014). Viet Nam Country Profile.

UN Development Programme. (2016). *2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development*.

World Bank. (24 June 2016). *Vietnam's Climate Change and Green Growth Agenda Receives \$90 million Boost*.

## **Cuba's Economic Policies and Development**

**By Marcos S. Ramon-Valdés**

What are the three major economic policies that the Cuban government enacted in order to achieve economic development? The Cuban government successfully enacted policies that allowed individuals to have their own businesses, reformed the banking sector, and allowed tourism to thrive in the island. These policies have helped the Cuban economy grow by providing higher fluidity of the currency and higher levels of employment. The importance of the analyzes arise from Cuba being a Marxist-Leninist state since their 1959 Revolution. The collapse of the Soviet Union and the recent normalization of diplomatic relations with the island caused a major wave of interest. Many investors, scholars, economists, and government officials began to ask about these reforms because the study of these policies are believed to shed a light on the future of the island. Wondering whether the communist system will collapse and embrace capitalism or will the system follow the footsteps of Vietnam and China with slow policy changes.

First, one must consider the historical and present problems that Cuba has faced before one can truly analyze the reforms because there is a positive correlation with historical events and the reforms. Since the Cuban Revolution in 1959 and the alienation with the former Soviet Union thereafter, Cuba has been greatly dependent on the relationship (Anderson 2015, 106). Cuba exported 87% of its products to the USSR and eastern bloc states, specifically in the form of agricultural products such as sugar and fruits, in exchange for oil (Valdés et al. 2004, 178). This meant that the entire infrastructure of the island was dependent in the constant trade of goods between the two states. The reason why this dependency existed was because Cuba had been excluded from 85% of markets around the world due to the US embargo (Cole 2012, 316).

With the collapse of the USSR in the 1990s, the Cuban economy fell dramatically into depression due to losing their biggest trading partner. This period of economic turmoil was known as the “Periodo Especial” (1992-2003) or the Special Period (Solorzar 2016, 142). Cuba at the height of this period was faced with a 7.5% level of unemployment, a decrease in the production level by 32%, decrease in exports by 20.8%, low food productions and a 10.5 rate of inflation (Solorzar 2016, 149). It is important to add that Cuba was also faced to an unkindly new debtor, as all of the money that was owed to the former Soviet Union, estimated to be \$44 billion dollars- higher than the Cuban GDP, was passed down to the new capitalist Russia, who did not bear the same socialist empathetic mentality of the former USSR (Smith et al. 2016, 535). This new priority to pay the debt has led to a greater public deficit and a negative balance of payments (Solorzar 2016, 142). Facing such problems, the Cuban government was left with the options of accepting the fate of their country as an economic failure, following the same road as the Soviet Union and go through a shock therapy, or reform their Marxist-Leninist system to accommodate with the new found deficit and depression. The Cuban government opted to reform their system as opposed to following the footsteps of the USSR (Bye 2016, 1663).

The biggest of the three reforms is the acceptance of local entrepreneurs to open up their own businesses on the island. The Cuban government has allowed citizens to own private property, whether it is houses, shops, and markets, in order to incentivize self-employment (O’Sullivan 2012, 328). The reforms to allow private industry within the state was meant as a way to reduce the 7.5% unemployment rate on the island, as well as to provide an alternate way for the populace to generate income while taking the burden off the government (Conception 2016, 6). According to Yailenis Concepcion from the University of Havana, an additional goal that is not discussed is the generation of additional income by the government through the heavy

taxation of the newly opened businesses (Concepcion 2016, 6). In this way, the government would allow for higher financial fluidity within the economy through the generation of extra income for both the state and its citizens. The plan was initiated by the government laying off 500,000 state employees, forcing them to start their own businesses. The state planned on having as much as 20% of its economy in the private sector by 2016 (Smith et al. 2016, 536). In general, these new small business owners became commonly known as “cuentapropistas” (Bye 2016, 1664). They have established many restaurants known as “paladares”, which aside from giving small revenue to their owners and workers, also promote ethnic Cuban cuisine and culture to foreigners (Cue 2012, 111). Similarly, many of these small businesses have taken the form of markets, workshops, small organic farms, hotels, studios, repair shops and other “offer and demand” businesses (Cue 2012, 112).

This reform has seen a high level of success. Many analyses show that half a million Cubans, which is 10% of the total workforce, are register as self-employed (Concepcion 2016, 2). In this same matter, annual statistics have shown that 20.15% of the register workforce is currently being employed by those 10% - the self-employed who turned to become employers (Concepcion 2016, 2). Similarly, the level of unemployment since the fall of the Soviet Union has fallen from 7.5% to 2.4% (Anderson 2015, 104). Another study reports that in 2010, 150,000 people were self-employed, and in just four years later, 600,000 people were self-employed (Smith et al. 2016, 536). This would mean that the rise of self-employment in the island has increased dramatically, even surpassing the original amount of people that the state had laid off. This rise of employment was successful enough to drop the rate of unemployment by 5.1%. Some might argue that these statistics do not prove with certainty that this reform has been successful in helping the economy grow. They cite the many interviews conducted with self-



employed individuals in which they express that there is an excessive level of control over their businesses in an unhelpful manner (Concepcion 2016, 5). Many of them strongly believe that the government has purposefully hampered the growth of their businesses. Yes, the taxation structure makes it impossible to create revenue or individual enrichment (Concepcion 2016, 6). The government also still controls the distribution of raw materials, therefore having a strong power over the rate in which these small businesses can grow (Concepcion 2016, 6). Yet, the hampering of growth by the government does not affect the economic growth of the island. This is because many of the small business are involved in popular illegal transactions; such as tax evasion, and under the table transaction of money, which most of the time undermines the government regulations (Concepcion 2016, 4). Another reason why this hampering of growth does not really slow economic growth is that; according to Concepcion, the government allowed small businesses to be created in order to tax them and produce new revenue. In this fashion, the state can grow other industries as a result (Concepcion 2016, 4). Therefore, it can be successfully concluded that even though the state is heavily taxing these small business, and also controlling every resource that these businesses need, the economy is still growing. The state uses the money collected to invest and grow other sectors of the Cuban economy, such as medicine and factories that are part of the GDP (Smith et al 2016, 536). The economy is not being halted, but rather growing.

The second economic policy enacted by the Cuban government is the reform over the financial and monetary system of the island. Since the 1990s, Cuba has begun to modify their banking sector (Solorza 2016, 147). This reform was originally seen as negative by many people across the government. Statesmen strongly believed that banking was one of the worst vices of capitalism, and passing reforms would allow for such “evils” to come back (Solorza 2016, 140).

In this issue, both Raul and Fidel agreed that the financial sector was in dire need of repair, as the inflation of the Cuban currency had reached a 10.4 inflation rate, the dual currency system was cumbersome, and there was little to no movement of currency in the island (Solorza 2016, 147). Therefore, the reforms were meant to modernize the banking systems to facilitate the control over inflation, fluidity of the peso and provide credits for foreign and local investors (Solorza 2016, 148). In turn, the government in 1997 created the Central Bank of Cuba, with a two credit level system that was meant to control inflation of both currencies within the island and also provide credits or loans at a micro level for small businesses across the island (Solorza 2016, 148). In the same way, the government also created private banks such as the Popular Bank of Savings, Bank for Credit and Trade, and the Metropolitan Bank; all meant to help solve the balance of payments problem by allowing more fluidity of the currency at a micro financial level (Solorza 2016, 148).

This reform has proven successful. The Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean reports that since 2007, after the banking reforms, inflation rates dropped from 10.6 to a dramatic 2.0 in 2012 (Solorza 2016, 149). This drop in inflation by a dramatic 8.6 points exemplifies that the policies to reduce the rising level of inflation was successful as the result of the Central Banks regulating the printing and transaction of the dual currency which provided order to the system (Solorza 2016, 149). Another report expresses that the microcredits granted to entrepreneurs has given birth to the creation of many small businesses, the restoration or building of new houses, and the establishment of cooperative organic farms (Solorza 2016, 150). The Political Economy Department of the Revolution reports that 70% of the credit was given to small firms, 28.5% to cooperative farms and 1.5% to private farmers (Solorza 2016, 150). The rationale of these credits were meant to start businesses across the island to reduce

unemployment. For instance, poor people are able to borrow money for construction material, food, and tools - all objects that facilitate the start of such businesses (Solorza 2016, 150). Therefore, it can be concluded that the policies to reform the banks was both successful in curtailing the horrible inflation rate, as well as providing liquidity for businesses to thrive in the island.

It is to be argued that the scope of the reform creates a system that only benefits a small handful of poor business owners, without regarding the long run (Solorza 2016, 150). These reforms do not facilitate a sustainable economic development for Cuba, or even a comprehensible reduction of poverty. The small businesses who are eligible to get credits from the banks are not capable of reaching a high level of production to be successful at competing in their domestic or foreign markets. The reason for this is that there is a big series of credit restrictions imposed by the banks themselves (Solorza 2016, 150). The banks do curtail the growth of businesses and the economy by creating limits on the money that can be granted to them. However, the province of La Habana reports that in its province alone about 2,038 credits were granted in 2014, with more than 6 million Cuban Convertible Pesos going to construction (Solorza 2016, 153). In regards to this figure, the number reported does not include the money granted outside of the province of La Habana. This means that there is much more money being granted across the island. Along with a tight budget, since Cuba is recovering from the Special Period, the restrictions are logical. There is not enough money to grant a substantial amount of credits to businesses to boost their growth to competitive standards. Even if the restrictions are taken away, there will still be not enough money to be granted. In the order hand, the Cuban economy is growing even with the credit restrictions. Marcia Solorza from the University of Mexico City explains that the revenue created by the banks due to interest rates are being used as

investment in telecommunication, internet access and banking technology to make credit more accessible (Solorza 2016, 154). Therefore, even with the restrictions in place, the Cuban economy continues to grow, as the money granted via credits come back to the government and are invested in other sectors of the economy.

The third policy passed by the Cuban Government was the creation of a formal tourism sector. Before the fall of the USSR, tourism into the island was minimal, and mainly came from Eastern Bloc states like Czechoslovakia, and Poland (Wilkinson 2008, 985). At that time, the Cuban government was distrustful of tourism, as there was a bad stigma reminiscing the era of gambling and corruption under Batista (Wilkinson 2008, 985). Ever since the fall of the Soviet Union, the Cuban Government has seen the prospects of the revenues coming from the tourism sector. The main reason for the creation of a tourism industry in the island was to accommodate a new income for the flourishing small businesses, as well as increase foreign currency flow into the country (Bye 2016, 1664). The desperate need for money acted as a catalyst for the state to allow European tourist to come into the island (Cue 2016, 111). Most of the money coming from tourism has been implemented in the construction of brand new hotels, administration of and other services included in the industry. For example, the state established state-run tourist companies like CIMEX, Havanatur, and Cubanacan in order for the state to raise hard currency (Wilkinson 2008, 982). Surprisingly, ever since December of 2014, the Cuban government has made it possible for tourist of American origins to come to the island and to use the dollars flowing to the island to invest into the tourism industry. (Cue 2016, 111) With the revenues generated by the entrepreneurs have taken initiative with “paladares” and other small businesses to accommodate to them, the Cuban economy has grown (Bye 2016, 1664).

The policies of open tourism have given Cuba a massive economic boost. In general, the reforms to invest in a formal tourism sector has been highly successful. The Cuban Office of National Statistics report that in 2007, 2.2 million people visited the island, compared to the 326,000 people who visited in 1989 (Wilkinson 2008, 981). This tremendous change is also visible in how revenues from tourism has overshadowed agriculture, with more than 43% of the GDP (Wilkinson 2008, 981). It is estimated that around 3.5 billion dollars' worth of currency are flowing into the country from all over Europe, officially surpassing the exportation of primary commodities (Smith et al 2016, 536). The Cuban government as a result has developed precise plans to divert the revenues from the tourism generated in the island to fueling the comprehensive welfare state. Especially through the twin crisis of the Fall of the USSR and the tightening of the US embargo (Wilkinson 2008, 984). Cubans who also participate inside the sector, whether in service or in their own businesses; use the hard currency gained as a result and go directly to informal markets to buy imported necessity goods; milk or yoghurt, which ensures the necessary nutrition to prevent starvation (Wilkinson 2008, 984). Another by product of the reform has been the restoration of historical landmarks for tourist destination. According to Eusebio Leal, the Historian of the City of La Habana, since the 1990s more than 300 derelict colonial buildings have been restored, with 7000 new buildings restored for proper housing and 11,000 jobs generated as a result (Wilkinson 2008, 984) It can be concluded that as a byproduct of this reform is the restoration of an aging city. Therefore, the policies of opening the tourism sector has been increasingly successful, helping Cuba sustain itself by bringing hard currency back into the country.

Some might argue that the rise of tourism, especially at the rate in which Cuba has been growing, poses a negative effect. The rise of sexual tourism has taken precedent as a result of

higher influx of tourist from the developed countries (Wilkinson 2008, 998). Women are so poor and deprived of so many luxuries that they resort to prostitution. The government has even expressed their concern about this issue, as they see it as a violation of their socialist ideology - no one in the island should be so poor that they would resort to prostitution. Sex tourism is an awful side effect of tourism in developing countries. Yet, this new sector is casual in nature, as no one is forced in or out, because it is based in the needs of the person. There is no “pimp” or violence within this sector partly due to the direct result of the lack of sexual imagery - that is porn, sex-shops or sex-cinemas (Wilkinson 2008, 988). Women and girls have seen the opportunity to make money off the wealthy tourists to have supplementary income in their pockets, not out of necessity. They become consorts and prostitutes, all depending on the needs of the client. Middle-aged men could be seen walking around with much younger girls at their side (Wilkinson 2008, 988). Therefore, sex tourism in Cuba has been greatly exaggerated and could even be considered a myth, as it is not forceful or violent, in the opposite, women go in and out as their needs dictate, some do not even have sexual contact at all. It is not an entirely negative effect, as it does not produce crime, and there is no clear evidence for such claims (Wilkinson 2008, 988). This phenomenon is officially called “Jineterismo” because it does not fit the criteria of prostitution. These women accompany tourist, sexually or friendly for money, and generally take control, as if it was a regular couple (Wilkinson 2008, 988). It can be concluded that in the case of sex tourism in Cuba, it is not fair to say that it is profoundly negative, as women are free to get in and out, with no violence as a result.

As a final analysis, Cuba’s economic system has faced a long term economic downturn since the fall of the Soviet Union. These reforms are meant to revive Marxism-Leninism and take a step forward towards communism, not to embrace capitalism. Raul Castro has made it clear

that he does not wish to embrace market capitalism or market socialism. In the opposite, the government wishes to develop the island by reforming the obsolete Soviet-style system. These reforms have truly helped the Cuban people, at least in the creation of jobs, houses, and new sources of revenue. The essence of these reforms, while keeping the socialist economic system and implementing slow reform, gives way to new anxieties. The normalization of the USA-Cuba relations lies in a fine tangent. Many ask questions such as; will the Cuban state end up embracing capitalism? Will the United States stop the diplomatic relations because the reforms do not meet “American” standards? Will small businesses be able to grow to a competitive size? Will the wages provided by the small business provide enough for essentials? Will the standard of living rise as a result of the reforms? All of these questions need to be answered in order to refine and even expand the analysis in the way these reforms actually help Cuba increase their economic development. What is certain is that the Cuban GDP, employment, and revenues have recovered since the Special Period as the direct result. The future of Cuba is yet to be seen.

## Bibliography

- Anderson, Tim. "From Havana To Quito: Understanding Economic Reform In Cuba And Ecuador." *Journal Of Australian Political Economy* 76 (2015): 103-128.
- Bye, Vegard, Bert Hoffmann, and Laurence Whitehead. "Cuba: Heading For A New Development And Political Model – An Introduction." *Third World Quarterly* 37.9 (2016): 1661-1665.
- Concepción, Yailenis Mulet. "Self-Employment In Cuba: Between Informality And Entrepreneurship – The Case Of Shoe Manufacturing." *Third World Quarterly* 37.9 (2016): 1713-1729
- Cole, K 2012, 'PROGRESS IN CUBA: THE REGIONAL DIMENSION', *International Journal of Cuban Studies*, vol. 4, no. 3/4, pp. 307-320
- Cué Mancera, Agustín. "La Actualización Del Socialismo Cubano." *Cotidiano - Revista De La Realidad Mexicana* 32.198 (2016): 107-114.
- O'Sullivan, Michael. "The Economic Reforms In Cuba: Strengthening The Country's Essential Socialist Character Or A Transition To Capitalism? The Impact On Educated Youth." *International Journal Of Cuban Studies* 4.3/4 (2012): 321-346.
- SMITH, ROY C., and INGO WALTER. "Understanding A Cuban Transition." *Independent Review* 20.4 (2016): 531-546
- Solorza, Marcia. "Reformas Económico Financieras En Cuba. Reinserción Al Capitalismo En Una Etapa De Crisis." *Problemas Del Desarrollo. Revista Latinoamericana De Economía* 47.185 (2016): 137-162
- Valdés, Julio Carranza, Juan Valdés Paz, and Raúl J. Rosales. "Institutional Development And Social Policy In Cuba: "The Special Period." *Journal Of International Affairs* 58.1 (2004): 175-188
- Wilkinson, Stephen. "Cuba's Tourism 'Boom': A Curse Or A Blessing?." *Third World Quarterly* 29.5 (2008): 979-993



## **NGO Involvement in Poverty Alleviation in Bangladesh**

**By Taylor Scheffing**

Poverty is defined as a state of pronounced deprivation in well-being, where feelings of inferiority and insufficiency are substantial. Poverty is “not static, but dynamic,” as a result of exogenous factors including but not limited to seasonality, climate, economic crises, and household shocks. (Gautam, 2016, 4) Labeled as one of the poorest countries in the world, Bangladesh is no stranger to poverty. Beginning in the late 1970’s and even more since the arrival of the millennium, Bangladesh had made significant strides towards economic development through poverty alleviation efforts brought on by the World Bank initiatives. However, widespread discontent with the World Bank has led to increased, dominant presence and involvement from non-governmental organizations. Non-governmental organizations typically share a public mission, where those in Bangladesh aim to work exclusively with those in disadvantaged, rural areas. The entirety of this paper will be addressing the growing question, what are NGOs doing to alleviate Bangladesh’s level of poverty? Known for its dense population, Bangladesh faces consistent struggle in keeping up with the demands of a continuously rising number of inhabitants. With their growing presence in Bangladesh, NGOs continue to implement microcredit programs, cooperative forming, and a direct involvement of beneficiaries in order to catalyze sustainable growth and socio-economic development.

Alleviation of poverty in Bangladesh cannot be explained without a prior knowledge to how it has reached its current state. As rapid modernization, industrialization, and urbanization flowed throughout the world toward the end of the twentieth century; rural projects for development fell short of those for urban areas. Bangladesh fell victim to the global capital net, most notably named as the World Bank-IMF trap. Structural Adjustment Programs became

increasingly more widespread, making everything within reach of private businesses and open for profit and corporate interest. These programs were supposed to allow for reduced trade barriers and a more market-oriented economy. While this seems efficient, it posed as quite the opposite effect for Bangladesh. As a country with one third of its population living below the poverty line and 36% also living in rural areas, such programs were not balanced with the country's economic state, bringing forth dissatisfaction and irrational impact. (World Bank 2016)

Many of the points of demise came from the removal of subsidies on food staples, the widespread retrenchment of workers, the high cost of social services and goods and the low wages of workers. Factories and public enterprises became dismantled and export-oriented. This translated into temporary, outsourced work leading to job scarcity.

Non-governmental organizations began to emerge worldwide with a focus on advocacy and consciousness, making Bangladesh a prime candidate to test their efforts. Compared to World Bank regimes, the incorporation of NGOs enjoyed a much more favorable consensus. (Muhammad, 2015, 38) The NGO model of development presented itself as accommodating and convenient for the vast majority of poor or underprivileged inhabitants, providing resources and devout attention to social issues. Their initial goal stemmed from an attention to inequality amongst the poor and disadvantaged, but their efforts quickly shifted to a concentration on microcredit programs. Microcredit is the allowance of minute loans to underprivileged borrowers who typically lack reliable employment, credit history, and even supplemental collateral. Such programs are instilled to alleviate poverty and promote entrepreneurship. By building on the strengths of the poor and enhancing health, financial security, and income, microcredit programs serve as a new lifeline for poor and developing countries. (Karim, 2014, 10)

Since the 1983 formation of the Grameen Bank- the first modern microcredit institution- in Bangladesh, microcredit programs expanded rapidly throughout the country. Muhammad Yunus, pioneer of the Grameen Bank, deemed conventional banking to be unfit for poor and developing countries such as Bangladesh, calling for a solution that would deliver minimal loans at low-interest rates to the rural poor as an effective tool for starting more small businesses. The Grameen Bank began as a proponent of social welfare without collateral, mainly advocating on behalf of women as they were and continue to be socialized as inferior and male dependent in Bangladesh. (Rouf, 2016, 6)

The Grameen Bank was quickly followed by NGO replication, marking the beginning of major programs such as Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee (BRAC), Association for Social Advancement (ASA), PROSHIKA, and Palli Daridro Bimochon Foundation (PDBF). (Ahmed 2477) After its early establishment as a movement to rehabilitate refugees returning to Bangladesh from India, BRAC now stands as the world's largest development organization. Microcredit programs have become the sole focus amongst BRAC and ASA, extending small loans to the very poor people for "self-employment projects that generate income, allowing them to care for themselves and their families." (BRAC.net). These NGOs have consciously acknowledged Bangladesh's poverty-stricken population be their targeted beneficiaries, with poor women considered to be of utmost importance. (Hoque, 2004, 23)

Although BRAC currently operates microfinance programs in seven countries, Bangladesh serves to be its largest source of loans and sustainable poverty reduction. BRAC divided itself off into a separate, client-focused branched named as the Rural Development Project (RDP), with a four-fold objective to "1. Generate employment opportunity for both males and females 2. To mobilize under- and-un-utilized resources 3. To assist in diffusing appropriate

technology in the rural areas 4. And to promote better health care.” (Bigman, 2000, 294) BRAC provides 2 types of loans to the impoverished: the *dabi*, which is given solely to women and range from \$50-700 USD and the *progoti*, which is given to either men or women who have failed to obtain prior loans. The *dabi* focuses more on operational loans for the furthering of industries such as poultry, livestock, handicrafts, rural trade, and fruit and livestock cultivation. The latter, *progoti*, aims to expand existing small businesses and enterprises. (Abdullah, 2013, 340) The targeting criterion for BRAC remains at households who have less than one half of an acre of land and whose occupations consist solely of manual labor. It has been estimated that 15-30% of BRAC members are from “non-target” households prone to fleeting bouts of poverty while the larger portion of BRAC members are of extremely poor households. (Zaman, 1999, 3)

The Association for Social Advancements (ASA) also stands as one of the largest, indigenous NGOs of Bangladesh. With advancements similar to those of BRAC, ASA serves to educate and empower the poor by integrating social incentive into their microcredit programs. They center their efforts on the newest generation; the principal objective being to extend credit facilities in order to increase income levels and purchasing power of households. ASA aims to achieve structural poverty alleviation by incorporating women and young adults into their margin of credit. Their individualistic approach is divided into 3 different credit programs: the Micro Credit and Saving (voluntary along with weekly) Program, the Small Credit Program for Women, and the Small Business Loan Program. Each are installed to conduct Income Generating Activities (IGAs), where each loan has to be repaid within one to two years. Few and minimal interest fees are applied. (Zaman, 1999, 4)

The impact of NGO microcredit programs still stands to be very controversial in Bangladesh. Many assume that the impact of these programs stands to be moderate, but not

substantial. However, the latest 2013 impact assessments (conducted every 3-4 years) from the highly recognizable NGOs BRAC and ASA appear with survey results concluding just the opposite. The assessments aimed to best reflect countrywide impact by random sampling 7,168 total microcredit borrowers from 28 out of the 64 districts in Bangladesh. 97% out of the total reported increased business capital and increased monthly income following microcredit loans. 94% of respondents stated that they have been able to create employment opportunities for others, 97% reported improved quality of food intake for themselves and their families, and 83% reported better-quality housing and dwelling conditions subsequent to microcredit loans. (ASA.org.bd, BRAC.net) The success of BRAC and ASA is reiterated through impressive statistics, with each dispersing over 1 billion USD in annual expenditures, including 175 million USD dedicated to microcredit programs. Currently, 5.3 million people of Bangladesh derive benefit from BRAC microfinance operations and 7 million people from ASA microfinance operations, where more than half of the borrowers are women. (ASA.org.bd, BRAC.net) Since 2001, the growing labor force participation rate has opened up vast employment opportunities. The role of women in the work force has also changed drastically since the installment of microcredit programs that are directed towards the empowerment of women and equal opportunity for poor. Cultural male dominance in the work force has always been seen as inevitable and unavoidable in Bangladesh, but women-targeted microfinance programs have bridged the gap considerably, leading to a reduction in female vulnerability in such a patriarchal society. “Empowerment of rural women and their participation in the development process has brought in a long-term positive effect, which is a direct contribution by the NGOs in Bangladesh.” (Begum, 2004, 20)

Eradication of poverty in Bangladesh is slowly becoming a reality as microcredit programs become increasingly more popularized amongst the disadvantaged, poor population. The Grameen Bank and NGOs like BRAC and ASA were founded on principles of generalized trust and public good deed, where a trust in poor people's ability to repay others has kept the industry afloat and thriving. Microfinance initiatives promote self-respect and dignity, encouraging hard work through individual efforts. (Al Mamun, 2013, 107) Rural households, workforce security, and even healthcare have improved greatly due to microcredit delivery and its commitment to social development, economic improvement, and trust in Bangladeshi people. (Ahmed, 2014, 2494)

Other non-governmental organizations, like co-operatives, are conducive to economic development and the alleviation of poverty in Bangladesh. Co-operatives are an independent entity of people who are united voluntarily in order to further a common, economic interest. They are traditionally based on the values of "self-help, self-responsibility, democracy and equality, and equity and solidarity." (Islam, 2014, 2) The presence of co-operatives dates back to the late 1770's, having been established by farmers and agricultural field owners in order to foster both psychological and economic growth amongst their workers.

Agriculture co-operatives remain as the most prominent in Bangladeshi societies, where self-governance drives their methodologies and theories. The agricultural industry operates as the largest job-creation sector in rural Bangladesh, where poverty and malnutrition are rampant. Based off of a collective goal to eradicate significant levels of poverty and minimize widespread hunger, agriculture co-operatives facilitate open access to production resources and open wider markets for trade and product movement. By ensuring "justice, good governance, accountability, gender equality, and participation in social enterprise," co-operatives -both agriculture and social

issue-oriented- serve to expedite decision-making processes, and allow for greater negotiating powers and broader land ownership divided among the constituents. (BCA.gov.bd) Although consumer co-operatives are present in Bangladesh, it is producer -mainly agricultural- co-operatives that dominate and contribute greatly to poverty alleviation.

Seasonality plays a large role in the agricultural co-operative sector. Levels of famine are subject to foreseeable rises with each coming year, as climate and presence of natural disasters are ever-changing in Bangladesh. Seasonal food deprivation, called *Monga* amongst the Bangladeshi population, poses a threat as income and food consumption are diminished during these times. The three crop seasons are named after three types of their most valuable and dependable export-crop, which is rice (*Aus, Aman, and Boro*). *Aman* faces drastic low crop yields, resulting in pronounced economic inactivity. (Khandker, 2012, 2) Because these challenges are a result of nature and are virtually uncontrollable, agriculture co-operatives help to facilitate year-round food and job security. Group-action and collective effort from agriculture and small-farmer co-operatives provide relief when sustaining a suffering population by reducing the separation between people's needs and their incomes. By definition, co-operatives are adaptive, where they seek to develop innovative, pro-active, and morally permissible solutions to the issues facing their county. Bangladeshi co-operatives' dedication to social responsibility and collective sustainable development has helped to reduce poverty levels and cultivate positive growth.

NGOs' direct involvement of beneficiaries in both co-operatives and microcredit financing, allows for Bangladeshi inhabitants to serve as a central factor in the national plan for development. The rural poverty-stricken populace thrives from an NGO bred idea that focus should be maintained in areas that increase human capability and capacity, and allow for a "well-

distributed, stable corresponding living standard.” (Begum, 2004, 16) NGOs base their ideologies on ways to identify and combat the causes of poverty, rather than changing the attributes and focusing solely on misfortune. By developing institutions and furthering the abilities of the beneficiaries, NGOs focus on developing internal agencies and initiatives to bring positive change and socio-economic development. Nutrition and food sources, sanitation, and health issues serve as the most pertinent factors when assessing poverty in Bangladesh, and the willingness of the population to aid in relief efforts. The proliferation of NGO branches has gained momentum and popularity due to their attention to such issues, but also their regard for accountability. NGOs encourage accountability, where the interests and concerns of the beneficiaries are to be addressed in a manner that confronts the problem and offers a progressive solution. By relying heavily on direct community interactions, NGOs build off of feedback and communal opinions to ensure positive growth for the people of Bangladesh. Studies show that 86% of larger NGOs and 81% of smaller NGOs rely on public opinion and feedback to improve the effectiveness of its campaigns and public awareness programs. (Gauri, 2005, 10) Beneficiary feedback is used to delineate the implications of imposed strategies for rural development, poverty reduction, food security, and nutrition. Investments drive this movement to climb out of rural poverty, where NGOs continue to implement investments in infrastructure, human capital, industries/enterprises, and sanitation in order to trigger growth that is not limited only to the agricultural industry. The global, pro-poor nature of NGOs, specifically those present in Bangladesh, employ stimulating tactics to eliminate such an over-bearing presence of poverty and replace it with available pathways for success and prosperity. (Nustad, 2014, 259)

Within the last 10 years, NGOs in Bangladesh made remarkable progress in lifting over 16 million people out of poverty and reducing inequality amongst its citizens. As of 2013, the



number of poor people has dropped 26%. (Worldbank.org) Outspoken NGO and government commitment to Millennium Development Goals have become extremely relevant towards amplified economic growth. Direct development of the agriculture, industry, and service sectors serve as the most beneficial. However, social sector development policies (women and youth advancement, education, health) directly and indirectly assist human capital development and socio-economic conditions of the poor. Easy access financial policies –microcredit programs- for the poor are important for access to resources, self-employment, and raising the standard of living, leading to positive impacts on poverty alleviation. Microcredit programs, co-operative forming, and direct involvement of beneficiaries have led to both formal and informal real rural wage growth and noticeable living condition improvements. The implementation of microcredit programs and collateral-free loans have led to the most distinct drops in poverty, where positive increases in other sectors of well-being are evident. Bangladeshi government combined with NGO influence continues to work to formulate policies and strategies to expand productive employment opportunities and promote labor-intensive growth. (Motiur, 2013, 22) While overall improvement is apparent, poverty continues to be a daunting problem, where poverty in rural areas continues to be more pervasive and extreme than in urban areas. Eradication of poverty and the disadvantaged population will continue to be Bangladesh's primary objective for development.

## Works Cited

- Abdullah, Naziruddin. "The Effectiveness of Micro-Finance Institutions in Alleviating Poverty: The Case of Bangladesh's Grameen Bank and BRAC." *Journal of Social and Development Sciences* 4.7 (2013): n. pag. *International Foundation for Research & Development*. Web.
- Ahmed, Ferdoushi, and Chamhuri Siwar. "Impact of Microcredit Programme on Poverty Alleviation: A Comparative Study in Bangladesh and Malaysia." *Advances in Environmental Biology* (2014): 2487. Web.
- Al Mamun, Chowdhury Abdullah, Nazmul Hasan, and Arif Rana. "Micro-Credit and Poverty Alleviation: The Case of Bangladesh." *World Journal of Social Sciences* 3.1 (2013): 102-08. Web.
- Begum, Syeda Feroza, Sawlat Hilmi Zaman, and Mohammad Shahin Khan. "Role of NGOs in Rural Poverty Eradication: A Bangladesh Observation." *BRAC University Journal* 1.1 (2004): 13-22. Web.
- Bigman, David, and Hippolyte Fofack. *Geographical Targeting for Poverty Alleviation: Methodology and Applications*. Washington, D.C.: World Bank, 2000. Print.
- Gauri, Varun, and Julia Galef. "NGOs in Bangladesh: Activities, Resources, and Governance." *World Development* 33.12 (2005): 2045-065. Web.
- Gautam, Madhur, and Rashid Faruquee. *Dynamics of Rural Growth in Bangladesh: Sustaining Poverty Reduction*. N.p.: World Bank, 2016. Web.
- Hoque, Serajul. "Micro-credit and the Reduction of Poverty in Bangladesh." *Journal of Contemporary Asia* 34.1 (2004): 21-32. Web.
- Islam, Jannatul, Mobarak Karim, and Ashraful Begum. "An Overview on Co-Operative Societies in Bangladesh." *European Journal of Business and Management* 6.31 (2014): n. pag. Web.
- Khandker, Shahidur R. "Seasonality of Income and Poverty in Bangladesh." *Journal of Development Economics* 97.2 (2012): 244-56. Web.
- Motiur Rahman, Pk Md, Noriatsu Matsui, and Yukio Ikemoto. *Dynamics of Poverty in Rural Bangladesh*. Vol. 1. Aufl. Dordrecht: Springer, 2013. Web.
- Muhammad, Anu. "Bangladesh - a Model of Neoliberalism: The Case of Microfinance and NGOs." *Monthly Review* 66.10 (2015): 35. Web.
- Nustad, Knut G. "Jude L. Fernando, The Political Economy of NGOs: State Formation in Sri Lanka and Bangladesh." *Critique of Anthropology* 34.2 (2014): 258-59. Web.

Rouf, Kazi Abdur. "Eradication of Poverty through Community Economic Development Using Micro Financing: Lessons Learned from Grameen Bank Bangladesh." *IJRSM International Journal of Research Studies in Management* 5.2 (2016): n. pag. Web.

Zaman, Hassan. "Assessing the Impact of Micro-credit on Poverty and Vulnerability in Bangladesh." *Policy Research Working Papers* (1999): n. pag. Web.

## **The Utility of an Increased Emphasis of Human Security to Improve National Security**

**By Paul Silva**

The concept of Human Security is rather new, having been coined and publicized in the United Nations Development Report of 1994. It is often viewed as being at odds with traditional security and is criticized by traditional security scholars as being too broad. Traditional security scholars argue that by prioritizing everything that affects an individual, nothing is prioritized. Realists and traditional security scholars believe that Human Security is overly ambitious, idealistic, and utopian. Realists argue that the state should prioritize National Security, which can be defined as “The safety of a nation against threats such as terrorism, war, or espionage”. However, I argue that the two different security paradigms are not at odds with each other. While I still believe that states will continue to prioritize the National Security paradigm in formulating their foreign policy, I argue that instead of adopting one theoretical security approach over the other, the adoption of Human Security paradigm can increase National Security. In essence, I do not believe that Human Security and National Security are at odds with each other, but rather a greater emphasis of Human Security in states’ foreign policy can increase their National Security. Through dampening the appeal of diversionary war and reducing the destructive effect climate change has on economies, communities along with human lives, a greater emphasis of Human Security can benefit National Security of states. Thus, good governance and environmental protection aspects of Human Security can not only eliminate the need for diversionary wars but can also prevent the most detrimental aspects of climate change from being realized.

Human Security’s referent objects are people. Human Security differs from traditional security studies because it not only recognizes the ambiguous nature of states but also redirects

the focus from states to people. Realists and traditional security scholars believe that the state is the fundamental guarantor of people's security thus the state must be protected at all cost. But the former Canadian Foreign Minister Axworthy notes that the state has "at times come to be a major threat to its populations' rights and welfare". So, Human Security proponents and scholars argue that instead of focusing on the security of states because they can sometimes fail in their paramount goal of providing security to their citizens, scholars and policymakers should shift their focus of security to people in order to account for states' imperfections in providing security of their own citizens. Human Security scholars and policymakers choose to bypass the state security and instead focus on the security of the individual.

Traditional security studies' referent objects are states. Echoing the concerns of Realism, traditional security studies scholars view states as means of ameliorating the unpredictable effects of international anarchy. They tend to study what is traditionally associated with security studies: military power, war, security dilemmas, arms races, arms control. Because other states were viewed as the biggest threats, traditional security scholars recommend that states engage in practices such as deterrence, alliances, compellence, and arms control in order to maintain the strategic advantage over neighboring and external states, all of which could potentially become threats. Realists prescribe strategic action by states against other states in order to succeed in the international system that they view as a leviathan, dog-eat-dog, self-help world. Traditional security scholars along with Realists and similarly those who prioritize National Security, adhere to Kenneth Waltz's view that "strategic action is the norm in world politics, and communicative action is the precarious exception to this more persistent trend". The prevailing mutually hostile and suspicious view held by many states in reference to other states precludes any attempt for states to cooperate. Thus, attempts for cooperation on human security issues can be precluded by

rigid adherence to traditional security studies and Realism. Now that I have described the two perceived conflicting security paradigms, I will hereafter argue that states can increase national security by adopting a human security paradigm to decrease the threat of diversionary wars and to reduce the menace of climate change.

Diversionsary wars are not something that exists solely in theory. The ability of an unpopular leader to engage in a diversionary war in order to rally the previously unsatisfied, potentially hostile population behind him or her provides at least a temporary solution to the problem of a society that is either in dire need of reform or new leadership. While it is not the only foreign policy tool that unpopular authoritarian leaders can use to buy time, diversionary wars prove to be the most extreme manifestation of a disingenuously created inter-state dispute. The logic is that by refocusing the populace's attention on a foreign enemy, the state's leader will experience a boost in popularity in the form of a rally around the flag effect. In Jaroslav Tir's piece on territorial disputes, he finds that because the public intensely reacts to territorial issues, unpopular leaders will attempt to initiate a territorial dispute with a foreign state in order for the populace to rally around the leader. It's important to recognize that bad governance leading to high levels of dissatisfaction causes world leaders to initiate diversionary wars in order to prolong their time in power.

If policymakers were solely to adhere to traditional security studies and realism, they would fail to recognize and address the root cause of diversionary wars: unsatisfactory governance. In democratic governments the citizenry can remove an unsatisfactory government through regular elections, in which citizens can make their voices heard and hold an ineffective government accountable. Inherent in authoritarian states, the citizenry's voice is ignored and the ruling government will pursue whatever unsatisfactory policy it wishes with little regard for

public opinion. Authoritarian leaders view elections as dangerous and unpredictable thus will perpetrate armed conflict so as to maintain power. Realism and Traditional Security studies would never take the aforementioned analysis into account when formulating national security policy initiatives because they view the state as a rational, unified actor and thus would assume that diversionary wars do not exist but rather are manifestations of the anarchic world order, in which states want to achieve power. One real world example of this phenomenon is Vladimir Putin's annexation of Crimea. From a diversionary war perspective, Vladimir Putin launched the invasion of Crimea in order to boost his faltering popularity ratings and ultimately succeeded as his favorability ratings jumped nearly 20% points to a favorability rating higher than 80%. The diversionary theory of war has real world implications, thus recognition of unsatisfactory governance as a cause of diversionary wars would allow states, civil society, and NGO's to neutralize a potential threat to national security.

The connection between human security and national security in the aforementioned topic of diversionary wars is that an emphasis on the good governance aspect of human security could have increased not only the national security of the aggressor state but also the victim state as well. If Russia had been governed by a popular, accountable, effective government before February 2014 then there would not have been a need for the concerned Russian government to launch a diversionary war in an attempt to bolster popularity. Without said diversionary war, Russians would not feel threatened by an increasing pushback from Western states in response to Russia's annexation of Crimea. Likewise, Ukraine would have increased its national security because there would not be a threat of an unpopular Russian governing regime looking for a diversionary war. Human security is oriented towards representative, accountable democracy and if this good governance aspect of human security was emphasized by policy makers, NGO's,

and civil societies, national security of states would consequently benefit as well. In an increasingly globalized world, a seemingly distant threat can affect the homeland more quickly than expected. Thus, the global reduction of diversionary wars through the promotion of good governance can increase every state's national security.

Secondly, there are a variety of national security issues that can arise from the devastating effects of climate change. In the form of direct effects on the state, climate change is associated with the rising levels of greenhouse gasses in our atmosphere that can warm our average temperatures. This increase in temperature has been documented to cause a rise in sea levels, exacerbate natural disasters, and cause changes to precipitation patterns, which can ultimately result in droughts or floods. While it may not affect all countries equally, the effects of climate change can cause economic damage and perpetrate human deaths in the form of massive hurricanes, cataclysmic tornados, and parching droughts. All of these forms of natural disasters can impair the ability of the state to perform its most paramount objective: providing safety for its citizens. While these threats do not take the form of weapons or military alliances as traditional security scholars would assume, climate change poses a direct threat to national security through rising sea levels that could flood coastal cities, exacerbated and more frequent natural disasters, which could destroy communities.

Traditional security studies and National Security strategists would not only fail to recognize climate change as a direct threat but would also fail to address the root causes of climate change—a drastic increase in human output of greenhouse gases. The very measures that national security strategists would propose to increase national security would actually be fueling the fire of climate change: increased manufacture of armaments, increased fossil fuel extraction to fuel next generation aircraft, and the manufacturing of armored vehicles and



tanks. While the aforementioned effects of climate change are not traditionally viewed as “threats” by traditional National Security strategists, rising sea levels, and more destructive storms all are real and dangerous threats to National Security that human security strives to address. Representing a transnational intangible threat, climate change is the antithesis of what realism and traditional security studies alone would recognize as a threat. The recognition of a threat is the first step in neutralizing it, thus an orthodox traditional security studies theoretical paradigm alone would be insufficient in attempting to neutralize this existential threat to all states.

Conversely, Human Security recognizes climate change as a threat to the individual’s security. Because climate change can directly and indirectly impact the seven essential dimensions of human security- economic, health, personal, political, food, environmental, and community security-, Human Security scholars and policymakers emphasize the importance of mitigating or acting to slow the disastrous effects of climate change. Strikingly, the United States Department of Defense, often viewed as a bastion of neo-realism and national security ideology, has recently recognized “Global Climate change will have wide-ranging implications for U.S. national security interests over the foreseeable future”. Likewise Former US President Barack Obama emphasized the severity of the threatening nature of climate change when he recently asserted that “climate change is a potential existential threat to the entire world if we don’t do something about it”. The recognition of climate change as a threat to national security by often considered temple of neo-realism, the United States Department of Defense and its Commander-in-chief, highlights the inadequacy of traditional security’s recognition of threats and supports further implementation of human security in not only identifying new threats to national security but also neutralizing them.

In conclusion, while National Security has been the traditional framework through which international relations scholars and policymakers have identified threats and attempted to solve them. I have argued that the adoption of a Human Security paradigm can enhance the National Security of states through accounting for the shortfalls of National Security in evaluating potential threats and proposing solutions to them. I demonstrated that Human Security enables international relations scholars and policymakers to identify and attempt to address the root cause of diversionary wars-unsatisfactory and ineffective governance. Human Security, I also asserted recognizes the threat of climate change to national security and seeks to mitigate its potentially cataclysmic effects, which would be completely ignored if policymakers and international relations scholars solely used a traditional security studies paradigm that focused too narrowly on orthodox threats to states: inter-state war, territorial disputes, security dilemmas, arms races and arms control. If states are to succeed in their paramount goal of providing safety for its citizens, the inclusion and adoption of the Human Security theoretical paradigm must be implemented as the climate change and diversionary war examples represent not only the changing nature of threats to individuals and states but also the increasing policy measures available to address the root causes of state and human insecurity.

## Works Cited

- Axworthy, Lloyd. *"Human Security and Global Governance: Putting People First."* *Global Governance* 7 (2001): 19-23. Print.
- Johnson, Keith. "Obama Says Climate Change Is a Security Risk. Why Are Republicans Laughing?" *Foreign Policy*, 21 Mar. 2016. Web. 26 Feb. 2017.
- Linklater, Andrew . *"Political Community and Human Security."* *Critical Security Studies and World Politics*. London: Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc, 2005. 113-27. Print.
- "National security." Definition of national security. Oxford University, Web. 26 Feb. 2017.
- Morgenthau, Hans J., Kenneth W. Thompson, and W. David. Clinton. *Politics Among Nations the Struggle for Power and Peace*. Boston, MA: McGraw-Hill Higher Education, 2006. Print.
- Khong, Yuen Foong. *"Human Security: A Shotgun Approach to Alleviating Human Misery."* *Global Governance* 7 (2001): 231-36. Print.
- Tir, Jaroslav. *"Territorial Diversion: Diversionary Theory of War and Territorial Conflict."* *Journal of Politics* 72.2 (2010): 413-25. JSTOR. Web. 25 Feb. 2017.
- United Nations Human Development Report. Rep. Oxford: Oxford U Press, 1994. United Nations Human Development Report. United Nations. Web. 26 Feb. 2017.
- United States. Department of Defense. National Security Implications of Climate-Related Risks and A Changing Climate. Web. 26 Feb. 2017
- Waltz, Kenneth, Hedley Bull, and Herbert Butterfield. *Theory of International Politics*. Addison-Wesley, 1983. Web. 26 Feb. 2017.
- Yudina, Anna. *The Rally 'Round the Flag Effect in Russia: How an International Crisis Turned Regime Opponents Into Regime Supporters*. Thesis. University of North Carolina at Chappel Hill, 2015. ProQuest Dissertations Publishing , 2015. Print.